JRAI Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute

Reviews

Erratum

In Michael Lambek's review of Nicolas Argenti and Katharina Schramm (eds) *Remembering violence: anthropological perspectives on intergenerational transmission* (*JRAI* **16**: 4, 913), owing to a *JRAI* editorial error, the co-editor (with Gerald Sider) of *Between history and histories: the making of silences and commemorations* was cited as Steven Smith. The name should have been Gavin Smith.

Education and learning

Benei, Véronique. *Schooling passions: nation, history, and language in contemporary Western India.* xix, 346 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Stanford: Univ. Press, 2008. $75 (cloth), $24.95 (paper)

We often think of patriotism and nationalism as abstract concepts, imagined connections, histories inculcated through stories, printed newspapers and novels, museums. All these require literate, mature audiences and creators, and analyses tend to be confined to adults. But as Véronique Benei shows so persuasively in her careful yet powerful book, *Schooling passions*, patriotism and nationalism are first encountered and embodied in the 'sensorium' (Walter Benjamin's notion) of the very youngest pupils in school. Thus nationalism and patriotism, recognized among the many aims of schooling, must be understood through the entire range of young children's experience: singing, drawing, reciting, selecting of clothing and colours, and storytelling. The depth of this embodiment and sentiment is profound, and can explain some of the non-rationality of the adult version of patriotism. Benei's subject is 'banal nationalism', or what she explains as 'the experience of nationalism being so integral to people's lives that it goes unnoticed most of the time' (p. 2). She aims to approach these topics phenomenologically, to make noticed what would otherwise slip past attention. Given the dominance of schooling in the contemporary world, it is appropriate for anthropologists to attend to its role in inculcating nationalism. Benei's subtle book could serve as a model for how to do so.

Benei takes as her ethnographic focus several different kindergarten and elementary school classes in the Indian city of Kolhapur, in the southwestern state of Maharashtra, in the late 1990s and early 2000s. Her research must be contextualized within the aftermath of India's war with Pakistan over the Line of Control in Kashmir and the ascendancy of the BJP (the ultra-nationalist Hindu political party) and its *Hindutva* agenda. Reaffirmation of allegiance to the 'mother country' was ubiquitous, in particular through depiction of the Indian flag. The very youngest students were encouraged to display the flag and to play war; in turn they often spontaneously expressed support for 'the country'. Everything Hindu was emphasized and celebrated, and a connection between the Hindu heritage and ethics was propounded. Despite India's inclusive rhetoric of multiculturalism, Muslims in particular are excluded from this Hindu-centred system, as nationalism often requires an Other and Muslims serve this function in India.

In Marathi-medium school courtyards in Maharashtra, kindergarten students adopt the proper, still posture as they 'sing the country into existence' each morning; Benei describes the performative nature of this song as akin to a mantra, which derives its meaning through efficacy. This is followed by the pledge, recited solemnly in order performatively to create an Indian family filled with brothers and sisters. One colourful element is the story of the masculine, Hindu hero warrior Shivaji Maharaj, clever rather than brutal. Benei weaves this story effectively throughout the book as she describes its eager recitation or allusion in all except Muslim schools.

Benei has chapters detailing morning exercises; singing, music, and bodily emphasis; mother-tongue ideologies; the inculcation of morality through textbook lessons; ideas of Mother India (entirely the province of Hindus; Muslim students never speak of India this way) and the vulnerability of borders which need protection; gender and the simultaneous production of masculinity and femininity. Two chapters focus on what were serendipitous fieldwork opportunities: a Muslim school and a military school, with significant contrasts with other schools. (The Muslim, Urdu-medium school challenges the conflation of nation, language, and religion; the military school demonstrates unfamiliar strict discipline as it trains modern citizens.) In each setting Benei draws on classroom observation, interviews, and analysis of textbooks, school trips, and holiday celebrations. We see, for example, how nationalism is interwoven in examples used in mathematics classes and offhand references to the country in grammar lessons. Between each of the substantive, analytic chapters, Benei intersperses a short interlude with student drawings and words (some collages, some reconstructions), emphasizing children's active interpretation and incorporation of nationalism.

This book builds on and yet challenges much of the concept-driven work on nationalism. Its interconnection of the topics of language ideology, embodiment, gender, story, schooling, nation, and patriotism is unique and quite persuasive.

I highly recommend this book to anyone interested in nationalism, education, embodiment and emotion, language and multiculturalism, or South Asia. It is extremely well written, up to date with theory and scholarship, and demonstrates nuanced interpretations of field experiences with young children, their teachers, and their families. Benei convincingly demonstrates how children learn to ' "feel" the nation within their own bodies' (p. 24) – and the power such inculcation must always possess. After reading this book, nobody can deny that 'the first stages of schooling in particular play a crucial part in providing exposure to political life and symbols of nationality and nationhood' (p. 2). The relevance for each nation-state will be immediately apparent.

Susan D. Blum *University of Notre Dame*

Rutz, H.J. & E.M. Balkan. *Reproducing class: education, neoliberalism, and the rise of the new middle class in Istanbul*. Oxford, New York: Berghahn, 2009. xiv, 140 pp., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £35.00 (cloth)

This short, informative book explores some of the critical links between selective education, neoliberal norms, and middle-class reproduction in the 'globalizing city' of Istanbul, Turkey. With major transformations in the social fields of work and education, brought on by market-driven principles and neoliberal state policies, the newly emergent middle-class families in Istanbul increasingly compete with each other and struggle to ensure that their children enter the best selective schools. By doing so, suggest the authors, these families hope not only to secure a 'quality education' and a 'comfortable future life' for their children, but also to reproduce their own class, and thereby exacerbate social inequalities. To understand better the complex relations of education hierarchies and class hierarchies, the book seeks to highlight the combined role of 'multiple agencies' – the neoliberal state, the market, the family – in the formation and reproduction of a new middle class. Whilst the early chapters of the book explore the post-1980 structural shifts in the Turkish political economy and the ways in which these shifts have encouraged the emergence of a 'cosmopolitan middle class', the later chapters discuss what it means to lead a middle-class life in the fast-changing city of Istanbul. The common thread across the chapters is the high value multiple that stakeholders place on quality education, careerism, and life-style issues for the shaping of a new middle class.

By drawing predominantly on Pierre Bourdieu's theories on education and society, the authors argue that the making of a middle class requires not just material wealth, but also 'cultural capital', and that education is one of

the key social sites through which this capital comes to be at once 'objectified and embodied', in the form of educational qualifications and bodily practices (pp. 13-16). Their emphasis on class reproduction through education is undoubtedly important, given that schooling is not an isolated sphere of knowledge that is exempt from ideological considerations. Yet the authors' class analysis suffers from a number of conceptual drawbacks. They aptly point out and demonstrate that the middle class is not a homogeneous, rigid entity but a dynamic, ambiguous practice. They, however, frame this dynamism and ambiguity in terms of a polarization between an older 'core middle class' trapped in the workings of a declining welfare state and an emergent 'cosmopolitan middle class' that is thriving under a rising neoliberal state. By framing their class analysis in this manner, the authors unwittingly reify Istanbul's new middle class into one homogeneous group, and hence do not capture the nuanced ways in which the meanings and practices of social class are influenced by ethnicity, gender, and religion. As documented in Jenny White's *Islamist mobilization in Turkey* (2002), 'Islamic yuppies' form a significant cluster within the newly emergent Turkish middle class. Even when *Reproducing class* does address gender issues, it does so in terms of a patriarchal family structure. Middle-class women are often described as 'exam-obsessed mothers' who turn their children into 'test machines' (p. x) and fathers as 'money machines' who complain about 'the high cost of tutors and private schools' (p. 124). The children themselves are completely absent from the book, with no indication of how they actually navigate between their school and home cultures.

Nevertheless, the book critically draws attention to a number of key issues that are often taken for granted in the literature on neoliberalism. Rather than treating neoliberalism as a purely economic doctrine, the authors cast it as a mode of governing and a style of living. Since the early 1980s, the Turkish state has actively implemented liberalization policies in order to encourage free enterprise and create a self-managed citizenry. Despite their rhetoric of efficiency and equity, the neoliberal state policies have 'benefited certain groups at the expense of others' (p. 20). Not only are income gaps 'within the middle class' widening, but also an emergent middle class is increasingly differentiating itself, both socially and symbolically, from other 'middle-class fractions'. Living in luxury gated communities, sumptuary consumption habits, and holding educational qualifications from elite schools and universities have become markers *and* makers of a 'global new middle class' in Istanbul. However, as the book does not offer a comparative discussion on similar developments in other globalizing cities, such as Mumbai or Shanghai, it is difficult to get a sense of how a 'global middle-class culture' is remade 'into its localized variant' (p. 33).

Co-written by an economist and an anthropologist, *Reproducing class* is a refreshing attempt to integrate the analytical perspectives of macroeconomics with the ethnographic traditions of anthropology. But by compressing their discussions into 120-odd pages, the authors unfortunately leave little room for a thorough exploration of their complex research topics and of their very informative arguments.

Mahnaz Marashi *School of Oriental and African Studies*

Stambach, Amy. *Faith in schools: religion, education, and American Evangelicals in East Africa.* xii, 228 pp., bibliogr. Stanford: Univ. Press, 2010. $65 (cloth), $24.95 (paper)

Addressing Terence Ranger's call of more than forty years ago for a more careful and sympathetic anthropological study of Christian missions and missionaries, this bold work of ethnographic theology or theological ethnography brings the anthropological arsenal to the explication of faith-based endeavours of non-denominational American Christians in the United States and parts of East Africa.

Traditionally, evangelical missionaries limited themselves to direct evangelization (teaching the Christian message) and church-building (recruiting new members); they were not favourably disposed to development or educational work. Early in the 1990s, however, they would only be allowed in parts of East Africa if they were committed to both of these and registered precisely as development agencies. This book tells how such policy changes affected a group of missionaries, both in the United States and in Tanzania and Uganda.

While American non-denominational missionaries struggled to accommodate themselves to the new government regulations without betraying their deepest principles, some Africans on whose behalf they came were criticizing them for duplicity: pursuing their avowed evangelical agenda under the guise of offering free education. But perhaps of more

lasting significance was local resentment of the missionaries' domination of the ecclesial agenda and their sometimes patronizing attitude to local Christian leaders (pp. 149, 165).

Some Africans maintain that the missionaries are naïve or ignorant, and that they fail to understand that African Christians will not accept a secondary or subservient role; for them, African Christianity is now authentically indigenous and mature. But many American missionaries fail to countenance this, and continue to attempt to determine policy. There is thus little true partnership, though this has been a burning issue in missionary circles and theology for over sixty years (C. Ross, 'The theology of partnership', *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* **34**, 2010, 145-8).

An important adjustment by the American missionaries (many of whom were not veterans but eager college/university students), and a key concern for the author, was their use (and, implied in the text, abuse) of social/cultural anthropology both for pedagogical reasons and as a key to understanding the local people. Largely from Texas and Tennessee, they were either would-be career-evangelists or students completing college requirements by teaching English in Africa. Yet no matter what subject they taught, they always did so by using Bible stories as illustration of their covert agenda: 'preaching while teaching', their critics maintained.

Stambach offers extended case studies and many references to contemporary anthropological theory (and a useful bibliography). Ethnographic monographs relish such detail, but a book attempting to bridge the disciplines hardly needs it all, and not every statement requires the invocation of multiple academic luminaries. More problematically, Stambach's anthropology will not always be clear to non-anthropologists, with its references to witchcraft (pp. 154-5) and levirate (p. 140); likewise some theological assumptions or statements will make little sense to anthropologists.

Faith is the primary motivation of missionaries, though, as Stambach rightly says, religion (or religious instruction) and education may overlap (pp. 24, 192), as may ethnography and cross-cultural efforts to evangelize. There should be nothing objectionable, in principle, to combining the two. It is in analysing the practice that one judges the appropriateness of these combinations. Though education can be justified on its own merits, it is liable to being subverted and used in brain-washing or proselytization in its most pejorative sense (using fear or force to change behaviour and even belief). Stambach employs a delicate and even-handed touch as she probes the missionaries' intentions, means, and outcomes, as well as the needs and responses of local communities in Africa.

Unfortunately (for this reviewer at least), she does not appropriately contextualize these non-denominational US missionaries against the broader social and historical background of other missionaries (pp. 74-5). Christian mission in Africa goes back long before the arrival of the group she studies – Particular Baptists (1792), London Missionary Society (1795), Church Missionary Society (1799), Basel Mission (1815), and a host of Roman Catholic Missionary Societies after that – and is currently well represented not only by mainline churches but also by thousands of AICs (the 'I' standing for African *Initiated* or *Independent* Churches). And she could profitably have used Lamin Sanneh's pathbreaking work *Translating the message* (1989, 2009), which shows how the receiver receives *ad modum recipientis,* and not only *not* always as the donors would like, but often with such great ingenuity and creativity that the donors might actually come to learn something from, and to be grateful to, the original recipients of their well-intentioned endeavours.

Anthony J. Gittins *Catholic Theological Union, Chicago*

Gender

Coles, Anne & Anne-Meike Fechter (eds). *Gender and family among transnational professionals*. xiii, 243 pp., tables, bibliogrs. London, New York: Routledge, 2008. £65.00 (cloth)

This fascinating collection is part of the Routledge 'International Studies of Women and Place' series. It is also a response and updating of Shirley Ardener's and Hilary Callan's seminal work *The incorporated wife* (1984), providing an opportunity to note how much has changed and how much has not in the past twenty-five or so years. Every chapter implicitly or explicitly addresses Ardener and Callan's work and the issue of change. It is tempting to note that 'the more things change, the more they remain the same'. Certainly, racism, sexism, hyper-male dominance, and total institutions have not gone away or, in many cases, even diminished.

It is interesting and instructive to note that very little if any mention of colonial societies is

found in the work. However, in many cases the archetype of transnational and total institutions is found in these societies. The absence of any mention of Georg Simmel and J.S. Furnival is regrettable, since putting these works in a broader theoretical framework of professional strangers and the dispute over pluralism would have added to their appeal and importance. However, I do not wish to review the book that might have been written but rather the one that was.

Gender and family among transnational professionals is a very fine book indeed. It provides rich empirical examples from a wide variety of settings, demonstrating the global nature of what I would have no difficulty terming expatriate communities. Indeed, most of the chapters provide at least some contextual detail in which the families live, allowing richer cross-cultural comparison and understanding. It is also important to note that the definition of family needs amending since the examples include single unmarried individuals as well as single-parent families. Indeed, providing various forms of expatriate families is one of the major purposes for this collection, pushing scholars to note how much situations have changed. Additionally, the time any person or family stays in a given area has also undergone change. It is rare for overseas workers to spend their entire working lives in one community or country. Interestingly, there are hints that this includes missionaries. I would have liked to have seen a bit more about religious workers, who in the fairly recent past would have spent long years in the field, returning home, if at all, only at an advanced age. There is room for a detailed study of such workers, looking at change over the last thirty or forty years.

Indeed, Ann Coles and Anne-Meike Fechter make clear in their introduction that change is a distinguishing characteristic of their collection. If one compares the first chapter, Leonie Gordon's 'The Shell Ladies' project: making and remaking home', with Katie D. Willis and Brenda S.A. Yeoh's final chapter, ' "Coming to China changed my life": gender roles and relations among single British migrants', the change over time among workers and conditions is very clear. However, it must be noted that many of these trends were quite apparent over thirty years ago when I was in Nigeria, and others have told me that one might have written a similar chapter as far back as the 1960s, especially about members of the Peace Corps and similar organizations. The difference is that while gender change and more open sexuality were novel then, they are far less so today. As Margaret Mead noted, every new generation of anthropologists reinvents the wheel.

There is little evidence that the authors of the chapters in this collection are guilty of this offence. They seek to find connections with earlier works as well as changes. Heather Hindman's contribution on Kathmandu makes this connection, as does Katie Walsh's study of Dubai. Rosalind Eyben's 'Becoming a feminist in Aidland', however, is perhaps the strongest example of tying the present and the future to the past. Eyben picks up on Raymond Apthorpe's concept and develops it very carefully and thoroughly. Anyone who has been in the midst of people working on aid projects will recognize the world she outlines and the relationships found there. Finally, Ritu Verma in her work on Madagascar and Anne-Meike Fechter in her discussion of the change from incorporated wives to expatriate girls demonstrate the changes that have occurred over the years while still showing the connections which exist with the past.

This is an important book. I do wish, nevertheless, that more had been done in discussing the world of children in overseas settings. Fiona Moore's chapter on German schools in London sets a pattern which others could have followed. However, my few reservations aside, this is indeed an important and essential work for those interested in the anthropology of development, and I recommend it highly.

Frank A. Salamone *Iona College*

Rangachari, Devika. *Invisible women, visible histories: gender, society and polity in North India (seventh to twelfth century AD)*. 531 pp., bibliogr. New Delhi: Manohar, 2009. Rs 1295 (cloth)

Inspired by the rich feminist scholarship on medieval Europe, Devika Rangachari sets out to recover women for the history of medieval India. This is a challenge. It involves collating the interpretative work of many generations of scholars before her as well as of organizing the contents of epigraphic and literary artefacts of three regional kingdoms – Kashmir, Kanauj, Bihar-Bengal – into a coherent narrative of the medieval past. It is to the author's credit that the monograph is tightly organized. It has three segments; each segment, devoted to a region, has three chapters. The first chapter of each provides a broad-stroke narrative history of the

region in time which introduces the reader to the main political actors and events. The next two chapters home in on significant female actors and issues in feminist historical recovery. Two themes emerge clearly. In the courts of Kashmir, women were significant political actors in their own right. In all three regions, matrilateral kinship systems appear to have influenced the success of male princes and kings so much that marital alliances may have been shaped by such concerns.

For the novice, this material is a timely and compact reminder of the unfamiliarity of the medieval Indian past – and its potential for destabilizing nationalist, casteist, sexist, and sectarian terms of history-writing in the present. As illustration, one can offer the glimpse of a deposed Karkota prince (Kashmir, northern end of the subcontinent) and a temple-dancer from Pundravardhana (Bengal, eastern end of the subcontinent) who secured the restoration of the Kashmir throne to the prince. Such an alliance confounds current notions of territorialism and regionalism. Similarly, reading about a seventh-century Kashmir that contained multiple cultural groups such as 'Tukhari' (Turkic?) and 'Huna' (old Persianate or western Chinese?) officers, or a Pala domain that included the 'Kamboja' (Tibetan Central Asia) alongside the 'Huna' and 'Kira', is a salutary reminder of the complex social weave of the times. Such diversity of cultural influences must surely have informed gender relationships of each region and dynasty in the period. It is a little unfortunate then that scholarly insights from that wider Central Asian or Southeast Asian domain were not more fruitfully deployed here.

Amongst the options available to the author were the anthropological insights of the scholars of Southeast Asian societies such as Jim Scott, Wazir Jahan Karim, S. Errington, and others. They remind us that 'power' was not always identified with activity, forcefulness, command, visibility. Identifying activity and loudness as marks of insufficient 'potency', Southeast Asian women often cultivated esoteric, largely invisible, and anonymous means of effective action. These esoteric means and informal institutions were categorized as 'witchcraft', 'sorcery', and 'irreligion' by those marginalized or threatened by them. Queens in Kashmir appear to have used identical means to manage conflicts, including the killing of grandsons in order to place nephews on the throne. In the free market of esoteric devices that was medieval India, indirection in speech, evasion, invisibility, and anonymity were values worth cultivating. Lamenting silence or absence may simply miss the point.

Similarly, a more expansive vision of marriage and kinship histories might have helped Rangachari to develop her argument differently. For instance, she observes that 'royal women' are absent as donors from the records of the Pala kings and their donations to Buddhist monasteries in medieval Bengal. This is a puzzle only if we expect 'royal women' of Saiva lineages (Rashtrakuta, Chedi) to live with Buddhist husbands defeated in battle or acquired as part of peace negotiations. Given our near total ignorance of domestic medieval architecture of the period, on what do we base our expectations of marital co-residence? Nor does the author take on a discussion of serial or simultaneous polyandry, a pattern well established for all Himalayan societies. One cannot help but wonder whether the Pala Buddhist-Saiva Rashtrakuta marriages were simply the flip side of the Kashmir marriages of Saiva princesses of higher-status warrior lineages, formally wedded to one lord, residing with men of their paternal-fraternal lineage orders. If yes, then the place to look for Saiva women's donating activity might be in their paternal and fraternal Saiva lineage-controlled temples and *mathas* (monasteries). If this is the case, then the silence of later historians (such as Ghoshal, Sircar, Kane) regarding medieval female rulers (Didda) and 'royal women' is explained by the colonized scholar's ethic of conjugality and legitimate reproduction. Obviously, many questions remain to be asked. By provoking some in this reader, Rangachari has reminded us of the allure – and the continuing remoteness – of that foreign country called medieval India.

Indrani Chatterjee *Rutgers University*

Heritage and museum anthropology

Karp, Ivan, Corinne A. Kratz, Lynn Szwaraja & Tomás Ybarra-Frausto (eds). *Museum frictions: public cultures/global transformations*. xxii, 602 pp., maps, illus., bibliogrs. London, Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2006. £17.99 (paper)

It is evident that the roles of museums change dependent on periods, places, interests, and goals. Museums engage the senses and produce a narrative. Additionally, they define themselves

in relation to other socio-cultural and civic organizations within local and global societies. Globalization creates new forms of communication and socio-cultural interactions among people who had previously been culturally separated and museums become the contact points. Technological achievements and the use of the internet help museums and the heritage sector in exhibition design by making information about the collections more accessible to visitors.

Museum frictions is the product of discussions, conferences, and workshops that examine contemporary museum, heritage, and exhibition practices in different parts of the world. It presents international case studies that focus on interactions and on all those globalizing processes that influence museums and heritage practices. This volume negotiates the sense of the museums as a social technology and describes the changing set of exhibiting practices that are central to museums today. The essays within the volume offer a geographical representation on the basis of common themes and concerns. Moreover, those essays seek to historicize international events, to describe cases and situations that deal with national and community museums, historic sites, heritage landscapes, visitor experience, museum educational programmes, exhibition design, theme parks, and cultural heterogeneity. The book is divided into three thematic sections: exhibitionary complexes, tactical museologies, and remapping the museum.

In the first part, 'Exhibitionary complexes', the authors deal with exhibition as practice. The use of digital technologies within the museums, and their significant quality in making images and information accessible through the creation of virtual museums on the internet, develop museum and exhibitionary methods. Another crucial issue in this part is the dynamics of self-transformation of museums into cultural capital flows, as contact zones, which expand cross-cultural exchanges; museums throughout these processes reinvent themselves by means of those challenging networks. The authors deal with the new cultural codes, the ways that museums organize their displays, and the education practices that museums use to make all those experiences memorable. Furthermore, the authors explain exhibition practices as the process whereby visitors witness cultural artefacts and are encouraged to engage aesthetically in vivid discussions by creating a sense of belonging and sharedness. Moreover, the authors examine the role of tourism as an opportunity for investment (they view economics as internal to culture), to keep alive, protect, and promote local cultures and heritage.

In the second part, 'Tactical museologies', the authors describe tactics of museological processes that museums use and share with other cultural institutions: how museums 'travel' abroad, and the ways that museums look for funders, the ethical dilemmas that appear in settling their collections, how they objectify memories and describe their methods to possess and preserve heritage. Moreover, of great concern is the discussion about the multiple ways in which museums become viable, how they contextualize cultural artefacts, and how they organize their spaces. Additionally, in (re)making a museum the challenge is its educational mission to the wider public audience for preserving and interpreting shared cultural heritages. The authors explore all those ways that museums seek to reach certain audiences and negotiate how museums are perceived within local societies and the different practices they use to approach cultural diversities and to promote global cultural awareness. Furthermore, there are accounts of how museums design their collections and organize thematic exhibitions to build and rebuild awareness and promote cultural tolerance and heterogeneity.

In the third part, 'Remapping the museum', the authors negotiate heritage management, and deal with the practices of opening and reopening of museums and their collections by discussing cultural influences; the 'gap' that museums intend to 'fill up'. Furthermore, they examine how museums represent and narrate various socio-cultural and political events of local and global societies. The authors negotiate aspects of globalization and the politics of cultural representation through case studies from international museums. There are debates on exhibition development, on slavery and slave trade in museums, such as the Cape Coast Museum in Ghana, the Smithsonian's National Museum of American History, and the Museum of the Confederacy. Moreover, the authors examine questions of heritage to issues of citizenship and rights, and look at heritage across borders.

To sum up, museums not only 'control' the past but they also provide intercultural narratives, display competing claims of history, and question present conditions. A museum gives voice to people and their societies within cross-cultural contexts, and what is in no doubt

is the fact that people move and museums move too. *Museum frictions* is a good introduction for students and researchers in anthropology, cultural and museum studies to understand globalizing museum practices and exhibition design.

Christos Karagiannidis *Anthropologist, Independent Scholar*

Langfield, Michele, William Logan & Máiréad Nic Craith (eds). *Cultural diversity and human rights: intersections in theory and practice*. xv, 265 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogrs. London, New York: Routledge, 2010. £23.00 (paper)

The concept of heritage is a basic category of our contemporary worlds and clearly organizes many cultural institutions. Its development increasingly unfolds in two main directions. First, the field scope of intervention has expanded. We now speak of cultural heritage as intangible in nature, spreading far beyond the work achieved by social anthropologists in the National Museum of Ethnography. On the other hand, it is a truly 'heritage reason' without borders, in the sense that it is precisely embodied by rights and an international bureaucracy at UNESCO. Whilst globalization threatens cultural diversity, it is therefore opposed to a rationalization and to international regulation policy of cultures.

This collective volume, resulting from two research workshops in Australia (at James Cook University of Northern Queensland and the University of Ulster's Academy for Irish cultural heritage, both in 2007), aims at opening a critical reflection on the category of intangible cultural heritage (such as oral traditions, rituals, festive events, and performing arts) and the connections to human rights. Indeed, as the editors aptly point out, there is a lack of theoretical perspective in a spreading field dominated by purely technical and legal issues. So this volume takes its place in a new critical series dedicated to this area. The main interest relies on considering heritage as the product of a genuine 'cultural practice' (p. 17). In other words, the core problem is to understand a field of forces which confronts several opposing issues that this volume unfortunately fails to distinguish clearly: ethical (preservation and appropriation), legal (protection), technical (conservation), and political (promotion and representation).

The volume is organized in three parts and brings together fifteen contributions. The authors are mainly heritage professionals (closer to architecture, urbanism, or law) and only four are social anthropologists. Nevertheless, the contributions could interest social anthropologists engaged in trying to sketch the contours of a political anthropology of cultural heritage. The first part examines the evolution of rights (human, land, and language rights) issued by UNESCO or the European Union. They demonstrate the potential conflicts between various rights (such as human and cultural rights in the genital mutilation of women) or between issues and, as a consequence, the need for a hierarchy of rights.

The second and third parts are devoted to tensions and contradictions between two scales: global and national, in part two, and national and local, in part three. On both scales, the authors analyse finely political strategies: for instance, political legitimacy of a national identity (chap. 11), local resistance of minorities (chap. 7), revitalization (chap. 13), and cultural tourism development strategy (chap. 10). Selection procedure (and a 'right of inclusion', p. 102) is shown to be a core mechanism in the constitution of a cultural heritage. Both parts, rich and well informed, have the merit of focusing on case studies in a wide variety of countries and geographical areas.

From these studies the following paradox emerges: where cultural heritage policies were originally and ideally aiming at reducing conflicts between peoples of different cultures, we observed the proliferation of conflicts and struggles to impose definitions or to recognize difference and authenticity. The globalization of human rights, then, leads to production or reproduction of otherness that will lead to more and more conflicts. Oddly, the premise of this international culturalist cosmology has scarcely been studied. A genealogy of cultural heritage as values, rather than as a history of legal discourse, would have told us a bit more about international heritage policy.

Finally, a more radical or more anthropological question could have been addressed: what should be preserved? And why preserving rather than exchanging, donating, or destroying? Through modern cults of cultural monuments, tangible or intangible (to paraphrase one of Alois Riegl's famous book titles), it is not only the politics of memories and identities – which might allow new traditions to be invented – that are played out. Preservation also emerges as both a duty and an ideal, while other values are thrown open and defended: What are tolerable and worthy features? What is

forbidden to be criticized? It is therefore another way to place the question of the sacred today.

Samuel Lézé *École Normale Supérieure de Lyon*

History and politics

De Wet, Chris (ed.). *Development-induced displacement: problems, policies and people*. ix, 218 pp., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2006. £42.00 (cloth), £13.50 (paper)

The purpose of this collection is to examine 'the factors hindering attempts to improve outcomes in resettlement projects' and suggest 'how those obstacles might be more effectively dealt with and outcomes improved' (p. vi). It would appear that the editor has *prima facie* accepted the phenomenon of development-induced displacement and rehabilitation (DIDR) as an existential fact of life. This reduces the debate on the nature and type of development to the extent to which risks involved in population migration can or cannot be turned into opportunities for achieving a better lifestyle. However, it is ironic that the ever-growing literature on DIDR shows that most governments around the world have policies which grant least importance to the fact of minimal compensation given to some two hundred million people affected by DID. In that sense, much of the scholarship is concerned overtly with outcomes of DIDR. Similarly, the contributors of this volume also deal with policy issues and bring out the constant presence of 'a tension' inherent in the situation of DID (p. 2). Hence, the tone of the volume also quickly reverts to outcomes in order to find solutions to displacement-related problems. However, much of the solution is often found in the process itself, and the contributors' references in chapters 3, 4, 6, 7, and 8 to inclusion, in DIDR policy, of the processes of active participation of displaced people in planning and implementation of resettlement and rehabilitation schemes should, in this reviewer's opinion, have become an explicit focus of the discourse in this book.

In chapter 5, Dolores Koeing has dealt with 'distribution of societal power' and 'conflicts of interest' among different stakeholders in DIDR situations (pp. 106, 111-12, 114-15, and 118-21). So while making a case for 'recognizing the complexity of DIDR', Koeing is also inevitably moving to 'the democratization of resettlement' and the need for the state 'to work in the interests of all its citizens' (pp. 123-4). Giving a philosophical hue to his discourse on migrants as a part of common citizenry, David Turton, too, has argued for thinking 'of forced migrants as 'ordinary people' or 'purposive actors', embedded in 'particular social, political and historical situations' (p. 13). He has made a case for reflecting 'critically on the practical knowledge upon which policy is based'. In this context, his cogent criticism of the term 'involuntary' for migration and displacement puts to rest my uneasiness with the currency this term has gained in DIDR-related literature. Michael Barutciski, on the other hand, has discussed the current status of rights and entitlements of development-induced displaced persons (DIDPs) and brought out legal distinctions between DIDR and other types of forced migration. This highlights the fact of DIDR remaining 'a relatively underdeveloped area of international law' (p. 94) and indicates the weak spots in the implicit logic of international human rights norms, which suggest that the displaced persons be given sufficient compensation to the extent of resettling voluntarily. However, none of the contributors of this volume have linked DIDR policies of giving minimum compensation to DIDPs with the land acquisition laws governing the compulsory usurpation of land by the state. This lack of concern with a vital aspect of DIDR could have been a concern of Barutciski, who has focused only on European Union development policies and international human rights treaties.

Recently, media as well as social scientists, including academics and journalists turned activists, have begun to pay special attention to the cultural discourse and politics of DIDR resistance, and this, according to Anthony Oliver-Smith, is leading to a reframing of 'the entire contemporary debate on development, the environment and human rights' (p. 173). As per this reviewer's observations of the rise and fall of many a resistance movement in India, it would appear that Oliver-Smith has in fact touched the raw nerves of those spearheading resistance movements by pointing out the major challenge of maintaining within DIDR resistance 'the coherence between the agendas, goals and discourses of the participants at all levels of the struggle' (p. 173).

Ineffective consequences of resistance to DIDR indicate that participation is likely to remain mere rhetoric if not perceived as a non-negotiable aspect of DIDR-related activities. It is not an exaggeration to say that none but

the displaced people can best understand the various ways in which displacement affects them. The participatory approach is likely to be adopted if we have faith in the efficacy of seeking the project-affected people's participation. To this extent Chris de Wet's approach, pinpointing inherent complexities around resettlement, also ends up capitalizing on 'the initiatives shown by resettlers' (p. 181).

Shobhita Jain *Commonwealth Educational Media Centre for Asia*

Gamio, Manuel (trnsl. & ed. Fernando Armstrong-Fumero). *Forjando patria pro-nacionalismo* (Forging a nation). xiv, 176 pp., illus., bibliogr. Boulder: Univ. Press Colorado, 2010. $45.00 (cloth)

Manuel Martínez Gamio (1883-1960), the founding father of Mexican anthropology, presented in this series of essays, originally published in 1916, his ideas for the steps necessary to build a Mexican nation. Originally published in newspapers and magazines, for 'middle-brow', educated readers, this book instantly became very popular, especially with segments of the country's ruling elite. Outside Mexico, Gamio is better known for his direction of the groundbreaking archaeological investigations in the Valley of Tehuacán (published in 1922), which established the basis for further explorations in the prehistory of Mesoamerica. However, like many other Latin American anthropologists, he felt an obligation to serve in an emerging 'national project', and, only a year following the publication of this influential book, became the head of the newly established Department of Anthropology (within the Ministry of Agriculture).

The publication of this book in English will provide an important glimpse into the 'anthropology of the contemporary' for both anthropologists and non-specialists. It will also provide a crucial insight into the development of Mexican anthropology, and the importance of nationalism in its intellectual history. Gamio combined his wide range of interests in order to provoke his compatriots into considering new directions in development, development that could only be achieved by combining elements of indigenous cultures with the ones brought by the European colonizers. In advocating this specific 'racial mixture', he opted for a kind of eugenics very different from its form in early twentieth-century Europe, where it culminated in the horrors of Nazism. In the Mexican version, 'the body of the nation' could be improved through a mixture of different *racial* elements, which would eventually provide for an 'evolutionary cultural fusion' (pp. 160-1). There are other examples of the time in which the book was written, like Gamio's sexist consideration of the 'three types of Mexican women' in chap. 25, his somewhat romantic idea of 'race' (strongly influenced by Franz Boas, whose courses he attended at Columbia University in New York), as well as an idealistic belief in progress and development. The translator and editor of this volume, Fernando Armstrong-Fumero, should be credited for keeping these parts of the texts in a format that allows us a clear insight into the social and political conditions of Revolution-era Mexico.

Gamio was interested in reforming different scholarly disciplines, putting them in the service of the people, and saw a special role for anthropology: 'It is a given that anthropology, in its true and amplest conception, should be the basic form of knowledge for good government ... Through anthropology, one can characterize the abstract and physical nature of men and peoples and deduce the appropriate methods to facilitate their normal evolutionary development' (p. 32). But there is also a place for other sciences, as '[t]he ruler should have the sociologist as his guide, and the work of the sociologist rests on the foundation of statistics' (p. 43). There is also an important role for the proper use of history (pp. 72ff.). In line with his interest in wider reforms, Gamio discussed Mexican politics and law too, alongside constitutional reforms in Latin America (advocating what he called 'Panamericanism', pp. 81-2).

The main importance of Gamio's work was in influencing the concept of Mexican culture based on its ethnic diversity, and using the analytical tools that anthropology (which he understood as a 'four-field' discipline) can provide for studying it. The subsequent (from the 1930s) development of an intensive research programme into the pre-Hispanic cultures (as part of the movement known as *indigenismo*) could not have been possible without his contribution.

Forjando patria is a document of its time, but, nevertheless, it is a valuable historical source for studying the development of anthropology, and the role it can play in a country's development.

Aleksandar Bošković *Institute of Social Sciences, Belgrade*

Gustafson, Bret. *New languages of the state: indigenous resurgence and the politics of knowledge in Bolivia*. xx, 331 pp., illus., bibliogr. London, Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2009. £73.00 (cloth), £17.99 (paper)

Arriving in Bolivia in 1992, the year of the contested Columbus quincentenary, Bret Gustafson hoped to witness an upsurge of indigenous struggles to transform an enduring colonial situation. Although he was not to be entirely disappointed, the immediate context proved one of neoliberal restructuring that was socially traumatic for the majority of Bolivians and politically traumatic for organizations such as the country's teachers' union as corporatist models of 'co-government' were abandoned. Yet the architects of Bolivian neoliberalism, representatives of an established political class adapting itself to changing times, became sponsors (along with multinational agencies and European governments) of programmes of bilingual intercultural education (EIB, in accordance with its Spanish acronym) that seemed at first sight to support aspirations to decolonize the state. This remarkable book is based on fourteen years of experience that included collaboration in the production of school texts in Guarani, participant observation of the implementation of the programme in village schools, and time spent in the offices of the education reform in La Paz, the ethnographic basis for discussing articulations between indigenous intellectuals, bureaucrats, state political actors, and transnational governmental and NGO networks. Gustafson's multi-scalar analysis moves through time as well as space – from Guarani country and back again – mirroring his peregrinations through EIB work and maturing understanding of the vicissitudes and paradoxes of its evolution.

This book is a spectacularly successful example of how to write multi-sited and multi-scalar ethnography. Divided into three sections with interludes that turn vivid narratives of personal experience into key analytical questions, beautifully crafted writing fuses thick description of people and places with consistently perceptive analysis. The book's discussion of the problems of challenging the coloniality of power through education has significance beyond Latin America, without sacrifice of careful contextualization. Readers learn a great deal about Guarani sociality, patterns of community leadership, and responses to a history of dispossession and racism, but also about the non-indigenous regional population whose autonomy demands represent a serious challenge to the government of Evo Morales. Equally valuable are the insights into the complexities of national politics that Gustafson provides by examining the careers of important figures in La Paz, such as former education minister Amalia Anaya. Although Guarani communities, teachers, and movements are the main focus of the study, judicious reference to broader historical patterns of peasant and indigenous mobilization and political dynamics keeps Bolivia as a whole in view.

Gustafson shows that the expectations that schooling in Guarani would promote decolonization by fostering the expression of alternative epistemes and subjectivities were simplistic: textualization of 'indigenous knowledge' and teaching in school did not replicate Guarani socially mediated practices of knowledge transmission, and Guarani saw the school as a means of claiming space within a non-indigenous society and state of which it was seen as an extension. Gustafson traces more ambiguous and complex articulations between EIB and indigenous political mobilization, arguing that Guarani are attempting to reposition themselves through creative, but partly mimetic, tactics that seek to change the meanings of citizenship, the state, knowledge, and schooling in a space of interaction with non-indigenous Bolivians. Advancing on some fronts but losing some local protagonism owing to new forms of central government control, and facing non-indigenous anxieties about indigenous political empowerment, the Guarani, Gustafson suggests, are struggling to build their own view of interculturalism from the ground up, on the lines of James Holston's 'insurgent citizenship'. One implication of this is that the neoliberal vision of intercultural education as something that indigenous people need should be replaced by an agenda of decolonization as something that non-indigenous people need, which is still proving a challenge. Yet Gustafson also shows why it proved impossible to contain EIB within the logics of governmentality and developmentalism that enabled neoliberal governments to endorse it, arguing convincingly that even when official interculturalism spoke the language of neoliberal governmentality, it actually relied on the very processes of racialized class exclusion and corporatist techniques of rule that it claimed to be ending.

Raising a dilemma of which many of us are conscious but which is seldom voiced so

honestly, the author points out that from the point of view of some Guarani the limits of his attempt to practise an 'engaged anthropology' lay in the fact that he did not stay with them. But this book's grounded academic reflection is a valuable return gift, a major contribution to debate with the potential to fortify the strategizing of 'uppity Indians' and their allies in the struggle for decolonization.

John Gledhill *University of Manchester*

Mazower, Mark (ed.). *Networks of power in modern Greece: essays in honour of John Campbell*. x, 278 pp., map, tables, illus., bibliogrs. London: Hurst & Co., 2008. $50.00 (cloth)

John Campbell was one of the pioneers of Mediterranean anthropology, yet the only teaching post he held was in Balkan history. After completing his fieldwork among the transhumant shepherds of Epirus (Sarakatsani), he came to realize that his conclusions about key concepts that dominated the lives of those remote and 'primitive' communities, namely honour, family, and patronage, applied almost equally well (the first of these perhaps less than the other two) to political life in the Greek metropolis. Over the thirty-five years that he taught at St Antony's College, Oxford, he supervised forty graduate students in anthropology and history. This volume, the Festschrift containing contributions by some of his students and presented to him in the summer of 2008, a year before his death, showcases the rich legacy of his historicization of anthropology and his anthropologization of history. Five chapters are directly concerned with anthropology, while seven are based on historical research; however, two of the latter, by the historian Mark Mazower and the anthropologist Charles Stewart, on the origins of certain Greek island saints' cults in the nineteenth century, stand at the interface between the two disciplines, and the one by Basil C. Gounaris deals in truly Campbellian fashion with clientelism in early twentieth-century Greek Macedonia.

Gelina Harlaftis and Sophia Laiou provide new insights into Ottoman state policy with regard to the rise of the Greek-owned merchant fleet between 1780 and 1820. Their research in Venetian, Ottoman, and other state archives reveals that, contrary to conventional views, Sultan Selim III took an active interest in the development of the Ottoman merchant fleet, and that the use of the Russian flag by Greek-owned vessels in the period was very limited. Helen Angelomatis-Tsougarakis presents a multi-layered picture of women's life during the Greek War of Independence, describing not only their sufferings (death, torture, slavery, rape, and starvation) but also their involvement in fighting, education, and other activities. She provides an anthropological dimension by studying the role of arranged marriages in cementing political alliances (the brides' reactions are not recorded, she ruefully notes). Mazower's and Stewart's contributions deal with particular manifestations of Greek islanders' reactions to the collapse of Ottoman rule and the takeover by the new Greek state in the 1820s, concentrating on the extraordinary incidence of miraculous sightings of the Virgin Mary and the discovery of buried icons, which were believed to ensure prosperity for their islands but also served to assert their ownership of their land.

Gounaris shows how social and economic cleavages in Macedonia became 'national' during the struggle between Greeks and Bulgarians for control of the region at the beginning of the twentieth century. He then explains how, after the incorporation of a large portion of Macedonia into the Greek state but in the absence of a strong state mechanism, relationships between citizens and the state were mediated by private initiative through a nexus of compensation claims and expressions of nationalism and anti-communism that were rewarded by jobs, pensions, and land.

John Koliopoulos relates how, since before its emergence as a nation-state, modern Greece has been subject to constant scrutiny and assessment by the West and has often been judged to have fallen short of expectations – a process that has suddenly gained new momentum as a result of the economic crisis in 2010. Thanos Veremis turns to recent history in his analysis of the populist political rhetoric and clientelistic activity of Andreas Papandreou.

Michael Herzfeld begins the strictly anthropological section of the volume with an account of the implicit theoretical underpinnings of Campbell's ethnographic work. Roger Just studies another gap between expectation and reality by analysing marital failures in a society where marriage is considered to be a precondition of full adulthood. Renee Hirschon examines the role of presents (often received without an expression of gratitude), promises (frequently broken), and punctuality (rarely observed) in what she calls 'accountability and obligation in Greek social life'. Aiming to make

sense of behaviour that is puzzling to the outsider, she explicates Greek local assumptions that one's sense of honour, dignity, and independence makes one reluctant to be beholden to others. Juliet du Boulay compares the religious symbolism of various everyday activities among the Sarakatsani and the villagers she observed on the island of Evia during the early 1970s, and João de Pina-Cabral, in the volume's only departure from Greece, uses insights from Campbell's work among the Sarakatsani to discuss the encounter between Catholicism and non-Christian beliefs in Brazil. Michael Llewellyn Smith rounds off the chapters with a useful factual account of Campbell's career.

Peter Mackridge *St Cross College, Oxford*

Sagi, Avi & Ohad Nachtomy (eds). *The multi-cultural challenge in Israel.* vii, 343 pp., bibliogrs. Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2009. $69.00 (cloth)

This book, edited minimally by two philosophers, comprises fourteen chapters, which are not numbered and which are presented randomly without any attempt to group them by theme. A bare two pages introduce the notion of multiculturalism but there is no conclusion to assess the arguments presented by the contributors. Indeed, the reader is not informed why or how these essays were selected nor how they cohere to constitute a book. The writers include four philosophers, four political scientists, three jurisprudents, two pedagogues, two anthropologists, and one linguist.

The major social cleavage in the State of Israel is that between its Jewish and Arab citizens, but there are many divisions within these categories based on religion, language, and ethnicity which the book explores.

Hannah Lerner points out that Israel defines itself as a Jewish and democratic state but that it has no written constitution, only Basic Laws. Clearly the Arab minority, about 20 per cent of citizens, is excluded by such a definition and seeks to re-define the state as a liberal-democratic state for 'all its citizens' (p. 19).

The term 'Jewish' is also contested between secular and religious Jews. Thus there are a few ultra-Orthodox Jews who reject the state, yet other Orthodox, the *haredi,* who recognize it but who are prepared to defy the civil courts since they only accept Jewish religious law, the *halacha,* which is God-given. Nevertheless the majority of Israeli Jews are secular, and have their own problems about the definition of both Jew and Israeli.

Ya'cov Yadkar makes a passionate plea for what he terms 'traditionism', a compromise identity between the religious and the secular, based on the individual's choice to observe some but not all religious rules in the light of modernity.

Two essays stand out, the first by the political scientists Asher Cohen and Bernard Susser on the links between service in the Israeli Armed Forces (IDF) and Israel's Jewish identity. The second, by the anthropologist Meirav Aharon, is entitled 'We pay our taxes and serve in the army'.

Cohen and Susser examine major legal cases that have challenged the definition of Jewish and Israeli identity. According to *halacha,* Jewish identity derives from the mother or from religious conversion by an Orthodox rabbi. The Law of Return, which entitled any Jew to acquire Israeli citizenship on settling in Israel, was predicated on that *halachic* definition until the Supreme Court decided that the children of Major Shalit, a Jew whose wife was not Jewish, could be registered as Jewish by nationality but not by religion. Thus the Law of Return interpreted by the secular courts broadened the definition of Jewish identity. Subsequent mass immigration from the former Soviet Union, under the family reunion policy, admitted numerous Russians who had one Jewish grandparent but who were Christians and who chose to serve in the IDF out of allegiance to the state. The authors note that in 2002, 1,000 copies of the New Testament were requested for the 'swearing in' ceremony of new recruits. They argue that service in the IDF is a *rite de passage* that bestows 'sociological conversion' on those who identify with the Jewish state but who choose to remain Christian. In short, service in the IDF challenges the *halachic* hegemony about who is a Jew.

Aharon addresses multiculturalism at the level of theory and practice based on fieldwork among second-generation Moroccan immigrants in Ashdod. She focuses on the Andalusian Orchestra, which they established with Russian immigrants and Arabs to play a fusion of North African and Western music. The orchestra depends on grants from central government for its funding. The Ministry of Culture, which embraces the idea of multiculturalism, insists that it register as an exotic minority to be eligible for a grant, but the leaders of the orchestra

reject that classification since it places it outside mainstream culture, on which they insist. This essay makes significant contributions to the anthropology of various sub-fields, for example of the state, of culture, of bureaucracy, of identity, and of classification. Aharon also offers a critique of the theory of multiculturalism, which she considers an American import uncritically accepted by the Israeli government and by social scientists. She demonstrates the strength of traditional fieldwork which both tests and advances theories and concepts, and also reports how her sophisticated informants embraced her doctoral project since it gives them legitimacy as a serious cultural group in Israeli society.

Although the editors state that they are 'theoreticians', they make no attempt to theorize about multiculturalism. Rather they assume that 'the specific case studies will expose important aspects of the character and structure of the current multicultural space of Israeli society' (p. 2). While this may be so, more input from them is needed, and they might have started to address the theoretical questions addressed by Aharon.

Leonard Mars *Swansea University*

Media, communications, and visual anthropology

Arno, Andrew. *Alarming reports: communicating conflict in the daily news*. vii, 208 pp., figs, bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £37.50 (cloth)

This book is volume 1 of John Postill and Mark Peterson's welcome new series from Berghahn Books on 'The Anthropology of the Media'. The series is to be an interdisciplinary collection of studies orientating about media production and consumption across the globe, inclusive, ethnographic, and with an eye towards non-Western media practices. *Alarming reports* is a theoretical anthropology of the media text with a US and Hawaiian background in contents and readership in mind. It also reflects Arno's interests and background in the anthropology of conflict communication and jurisprudence. It is, then, a curious choice of first text.

Arno's core thesis is that the news is a disorder or disruption of the present, a threat posed to the reader as perceived by the news editor, and thus a speech genre and conflict communication through the mediums of newspaper and television primarily. News stories are 'news acts', part of a semiotic chain or communication triad between *event*, *story,* and *reader*. They are second-order – a representation of a representation – entextualizations of threat passed through the communication medium: the social anchor for the emerging conflict discourse system. Arno continues his theoretical modelling by presenting the latter as one of two theories of news. The first is the civic model, which is a commonsense US view of the news as a work product of a newpaper or television show, an institutionalized form of communication based upon the idea of consensus and information dissemination. The second is the conflict discourse system model, which recognizes the multiplicity of views and conceptualizations of events, such as the 1993 standoff at Waco, which has Senators railing against taxpayer costs, conspiracy theorists suspicious of government intrusions, and the public fearing extremist behaviour. Arno is also a poststructuralist who sees individuals enmeshed within systems of communication, one of which is this conflict discourse perspective. So too our identities, expectations, desires, and fears.

After Austin, Arno goes on to suggest that the news is a kind of speech act, an alarming communication report at an interpersonal level, one which holds truth dependent upon the mass of users, and one which is advertised according to the editor's threshold of alarm. There are similarities here between the law and the news, both as conflict communication systems, both as kinds of speech act, both enmeshed in each other. One of Arno's brief examples here is of Kalipi indigenous land tenure rights to cultural materials (fruit, leaves) in Hawaiian jurisprudence versus US laws on private property. Another is of policy talk in the media from the US House of Congress aired on C-SPAN. The rhetorics of persuasion link these cases. They also show the strength of the communication mediums and the problem of individual agency before such structures, be they the speaker, the writer, or even the presumed-to-be 'rational' news consumer. Arno leaves space for the individual agent in his thesis by invoking *agent internal* and *agent external* structural theories in the space of the news (a story 'with legs' carries a 'narrative energy' about it just as a reader of a story imbues a 'psychic energy' with his or her mind [pp. 117-18]). These theories and ideas about the news all come together towards the end of the book

in a discourse analysis of US journalism and local news coverage of the collapse of a girder injuring construction workers on the H-3 Hawaiian freeway. The story is shown to be picked up by different competing interest groups (news reporters, union leaders, and indigenous spiritualists).

News, according to Arno, is defined on a person-by-person basis, and in this book we get many commentaries on how the public readers would respond to stories as communities of readers; we even get a criticism of 'ignorant, dysfunctional journalism' (p. 190) linked with ignorant and dysfunctional consumers; and yet, in this text, we do not get to hear from any of these journalists or consumers other than through the author's interpretations from several new stories and their follow-up new items. This, then, is not an ethnography of the newsroom (Paterson's *Making online news*, 2008) or of foreign correspondents (Hannerz's *Foreign news*, 2004) or of news or television organizations and their reception (Lutz and Collins's *Reading National Geographic*, 1993; Abu-Lughod's *Dramas of nationhood*, 2005). In *Alarming reports*, we get an elaborate conflict communication framework linking the news to alarm (presumably we can equate 'travel writing' to 'calm'?). This book will hopefully be of use, then, for the subsequent ethnographies in the series.

Jonathan Skinner *The Queen's University of Belfast*

Horst, Heather A. & Daniel Miller. *The cell phone: an anthropology of communication*. ix, 212 pp., tables, bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berg Publishers, 2006. £50.00 (cloth), £16.99 (paper)

The recent spread of mobile phones in low-income countries has sparked widespread enthusiasm and many have predicted that by facilitating the circulation of information, the technology will enhance socio-economic development. Drawing on ethnographic research in Jamaica, Heather Horst and Daniel Miller are among the first to challenge this perspective. Through exploring mobile phone use among low-income Jamaicans, *The cell phone* proposes a nuanced evaluation of the impacts of the technology on development that highlights its ambivalence, rather than its role as a panacea. To make sense of these tensions, the authors rely on the concept of 'expansive realization', developed by Miller and Slater in *The Internet* (2000), which draws attention to the ways in which technologies are used to resolve or, at least, address some of the contradictions that emerge between aspirations and limited opportunities.

The book comprises nine chapters (including introduction and conclusion) that draw on field research conducted in urban and rural fieldsites. Horst and Miller situate their assessment of the impacts of mobile phones within the Jamaican 'communicative ecology' (p. 11) and therefore provide a socio-historical portrait of communication in the region. Following an analysis of the insertion of mobile phone operators within the Jamaican economy (chap. 2), the book shifts its attention towards users and their everyday engagement with the technology. It is in chapters 5, 6, 7, and 8 that the reader really gets a sense of the texture of the phenomenon and of what expansive realization entails in this context. 'Link-up' (chap. 5) elaborates on how Jamaicans use mobile phones to extend networks – through numerous short calls – rather than to intensify pre-existent networks. It is followed by 'Coping' (chap. 6), which examines the co-ordination of coping strategies and the lubrication of redistribution networks (local and transnational) via the phone. 'Pressure' (chap. 7) then moves away from the pragmatic side of phone use to address how mobile communication ties into stress-relief. It is also in this chapter that we learn more about the gendered dimensions of communication in Jamaica. The authors finally assess the phone's role in enhancing 'Welfare' (chap. 8), at times in an unexpected fashion, in the areas of health, security, education, and religion.

Horst and Miller conclude with an 'Evaluation' (chap. 9) of mobile phones that will dishearten those interested in the developmental potential of information communication technologies in low-income countries. They argue that mobile phone communication contributes to the alleviation of poverty, owing to its role in the lubrication of coping strategies – the phone is described as 'the new heart of economic survival' (p. 108) – but that Jamaicans only occasionally use their phones to engage in income-generating activities. In fact, mobile phones might even hinder development by facilitating the redistribution of resources that could have otherwise been invested. The authors emphasize, however, that such conclusions are context-specific and might therefore not be generalizable to other locales. The implications of such findings, on the other hand, are much broader: the rich ethnographic material

underscores the dialectical nature of the relationship between users and technologies while skilfully helping bridge the gap between policy and anthropology.

The debates likely to inspire policy-makers might, however, appear less relevant for an anthropological audience. And despite the broad focus of the book, some omissions beg further questions about the limits of a mutual exchange between what the authors call 'evaluation and ethnography' (p. 170). We learn, for example, much about how Jamaicans use their phones to cope, but only little about how they use them to have fun, although such practices presumably have repercussions on development. A deeper look at gender and intergenerational relations, and their articulation with mobile phone use, would have also added nuance to the category of 'low-income Jamaican'. That said, the comparison between urban and rural fieldsites highlights similarities of experience that justify the relevance of such a focus. Assessing the ramifications of mobile communication among low-income users is indeed timely not only because of the scope of the phenomenon, but also because impacts of new technologies are still too often assumed rather than critically examined. To date, *The cell phone* is the only monograph-length, ethnographically grounded publication on the everyday use of mobile phones in a low-income country. It therefore stands as a landmark in mobile phone studies that will appeal to a wide audience and that is likely to frame debates in this field for some time to come. The book also sets the grounds for an anthropology of mobile communication that proposes to move beyond – though not away from – an economic reading of this fascinating global phenomenon.

Julie Soleil Archambault *School of Oriental and African Studies*

Morton, Christopher & Elizabeth Edwards (eds). *Photography, anthropology and history: expanding the frame*. xix, 290 pp., illus., bibliogrs. Farnham, Burlington: Ashgate, 2010. £60.00 (cloth)

Attempts to collate into a coherent study essays first pulled together in the context of a workshop (in this instance 'Revisiting the History of Visual Anthropology' in 2005) are inevitably fraught with danger. The disparate nature of the contributions can make a later ordering sometimes somewhat arbitrary. Christopher Morton and Elizabeth Edwards cannot fully avoid this inherent danger, and one or two of the essays in this collection feel they have been given space despite not being central to the overall theme. Altogether, however, the refreshing uniqueness of the subject matter they are collating in this instance makes variety a virtue. In addition, much thought clearly went into the structure of the book, with more than half the chapters commissioned after the workshop to enable, presumably, a more coherent overall presentation.

This will undoubtedly become a standard text, positing, in the editors' words, the 'ongoing relevance and importance of studying the interaction between anthropology's visual history and contemporary issues of identity and memory'. The editors are aware and acknowledge that there is inevitable diversity in bringing together essays reflecting responses to visualizing such historical themes as nineteenth-century British antiquities and folk customs; Boas's survey of Kwakwata'wakw ceremonial life; Evans-Pritchard's photographs of the Zande witch-doctor Kamanga; Kathleen Haddon's photographs in Papua New Guinea; visual methods in early Japanese anthropology; the visual anthropology of Koch-Grunberg at the beginning of the twentieth century in South America; John Layard's Vanuatu photographs of 1914 and 1915; visual history in Rovaina, the Solomons; and Beatrice Blackwood's Kainai collection from Canada, 1925. These are preceded by a couple of more general essays on ethnographic imagery in early panoramas and maps, followed by the story of the convergence of anthropology and film through the eyes of Jean Rouch and John Marshall after the Second World War.

All the essays hold intrinsic fascination within the context of their own ethnographic boundaries, but the overall purpose of the collection is not as an ethnographic survey but to posit the relevance of images and archives to anthropological thought and analysis. This is a greater challenge, and makes the introduction by Edwards and Morton the most important and inevitably complex contribution to the whole. The ambition, in their words, is to 'suggest ways in which visual methods, and a consideration of photography and photographs, constitutes an increasingly important prism through which to address wider theoretical concerns within mainstream anthropology, and thus the contribution of the visual, and indeed material, to anthropological thought'. The springboard for the idea that photography within its historical and ethnographic context deserves and is now

receiving analytical attention undoubtedly stems in the UK from the publication in 1992 of Elizabeth Edwards's study *Anthropology and photography 1860-1920*. Following a wider interest in the 1970s and 1980s in looking at the importance of the legacy of photographic collections (in that instance the Royal Anthropological Institute Archive), Edwards realized how little attention had been paid to how photography can form an important part of understanding 'reflexive theory and method and the construction of disciplinary knowledge'. The Morton and Edwards essays will surely become an important part of addressing that concern.

Impossible though it is to select individual essays for closer attention within a short review, I none the less found myself particularly drawn to Christopher Morton's analysis ('Initiation of Kamanga') of a series of photographs from the Evans-Pritchard archive at the Pitt Rivers Museum. As Evans-Pritchard's research assistant at the end of the 1960s, in reading this essay I found it fascinating to imagine how he would have regarded such an ingenious look at his series of photographs alongside the vernacular texts forty years later. I suspect with approval. Morton is careful to look at Evans-Pritchard's photography from 'the perspective of his core field-work methodology, that of writing vernacular texts', and, through his additional and detailed look at the images, the texts, and the annotations in his notes, he provides an extraordinarily rich and insightful addition to both the Azande and the reflexive role of the fieldworker in the best tradition of the discipline.

André Singer *University of Southern California*

Medical anthropology

Clarke, Morgan. *Islam and new kinship: reproductive technology and the Shariah in Lebanon*. xii, 249 pp., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £40.00 (cloth)

This engaging book addresses a fundamental question: How do artificial reproductive technologies (ARTs) challenge underlying notions of kinship, and what is the nature of the 'belongingness' (legally and socially) of the children born from their use? This raises complex moral as well as religious issues, making infertility a subject of increasing interest to anthropologists in the West. Clarke tackles it in the context of the contemporary debate among religious leaders in Lebanon and the Middle East more broadly as well as of actual clinical practice.

The Middle East case is important in its rapid, largely unregulated growth in the supply of ARTs, but also as a setting where reproduction is valued not only in its own right but as a key to social order. Lebanon is a fascinating case study in that its multi-confessional society accords a prominent role to religious values and religious institutions as sources both of personal status legislation and of social welfare. In the words of a doctor: 'You have to go to the *ta'ifah* [confessional community] for everything in your life, not the state' (p. 59). The author is careful to note, however, that this situation originated from a colonially instituted system that granted the various communities their own religious courts with jurisdiction over matters of personal status. As a result, 'Personal status law in Lebanon has a nominally closer relation to its religious origins than in much (if not all) of the Middle East, where Islamic family law courts commonly apply personal status laws codified in the modern era' (p. 58).

Clarke's book draws on ethnographic material from fieldwork in Lebanon (in 2004 and 2008) and is based on interviews with clinicians providing infertility services in Lebanon, copious readings of religious texts on ARTs in Arabic, as well as interviews and correspondence with prominent religious leaders of both Muslim and Christian sects. By his own admission, he does not aim to capture the experiences of individuals or couples undergoing treatment, both because of his gender and because that aspect has been covered in the anthropological literature on infertility in the Middle East, notably by Marcia Inhorn.

Both Sunni and Shiite *ulema* interviewed agree with the use of ARTs in the case of procedures involving the husband and wife, and view the resulting offspring as legitimate. More problematic, however, is the use of third parties, which threatens to undermine clear lines of paternal and maternal affiliation. Unlike in the West, Islamic views differentiate between sperm versus egg donation by third parties. Donor eggs are not permitted by Sunnis, but are allowed by many Shi'ites, with an intriguing proviso stipulating recourse to the Shi'ite practice of temporary marriage. This permits the temporary legal union between the egg donor and the husband of the egg recipient. Fundamental to the acceptability of ARTs to Muslim leaders is the three-fold notion of relatedness in Islam: in reproduction through

marriage, relatedness through marriage, but with a third category of kinship achieved through the process of breastfeeding by a non-relative who becomes related to the baby she nurtures. Delineating how this so-called 'milk kinship' is translated into the new debates about ARTs and the conflicting rights of the donor versus gestational mother, for example, is one of the author's main contributions.

Even within the same sect, the diversity of views among Muslim religious leaders is striking. Thus individuals seeking ART treatment are faced with a range of opinions justified through careful reasoning and accessible through various electronic media as well as in person. While Islamic views are more the focus of the book, the author notes major differences with the Christian sects in Lebanon. Maronites, for example, forbid any artificial interference in the process of reproduction. Underlying differences in the legality of divorce and adoption (with divorce being disallowed but adoption allowed by Christian leaders, in contrast to Muslim views) have implications for clinical practice.

Central to the contributions of the book is its portrayal of Islamic law as an open-ended, fluid discourse rather than the rigidly codified system often envisioned. The book provides ample documentation of religious leaders' willingness to be flexible in interpretation, proferring advice that changes according to social circumstances and individual situation. Not surprisingly, actual practice often deviates considerably from the prevailing religious views. The book thus presents far from a monolithic Islam but one constantly in flux in an effort to keep up with rapid changes in science, technology, and the social needs of those seeking their religious guidance.

Interviews with doctors are also revealing: they yearn for state regulation in a context where there is little legal protection for controversial procedures. 'I'm on my own', one reported, and all were mindful of their reputation in a competitive medical climate. Yet infertility is but a case study of the many conundrums plaguing social policy in Lebanon, where the challenge of having eighteen religious groups agree on a law results in limited public intervention, which in turn leaves religious communalism as the final adjudicator.

The book is theoretically sophisticated, beautifully written, and brilliantly cohesive. The author is to be commended for his unflagging engagement with a complex Islamic legal literature, with interviewees supplying him with massive tomes in Arabic containing their legal positions. Most admirable is the endeavour to analyse the perspectives revealed 'on their own terms' within the societies that produce them.

Jocelyn DeJong *American University of Beirut*

Klaits, Frederick. *Death in a church of life: moral passion during Botswana's time of AIDS*. xvi, 352 pp., maps, figs, table, bibliogr. London, Berkeley: Univ. California Press, 2010. £16.95 (paper)

Christian evangelists in Africa, as this book illustrates, aggressively problematize sex and witchcraft. They associate sex with dancing and polygamous marriages, and the observing of ancestral rituals with encouraging witchcraft. The status of converts, 'born again' Christians, demands complete rupture with these traditional practices.

Baitshepi church of Bishop MmaMaipelo in Botswana's capital city Gaborone, the focus of this volume, eschews these preoccupations with sin and salvation by interpreting physical and moral suffering as God's own language and the Bible as a text open to different interpretations. Poverty, the manifestation of unequal access to opportunities, housing, and social care repudiates the modernity ideology promoting individualism, self-reliance, and success. The central spiritual exercise of faith (Tumelo) guides the discourse on sickness and death. The word of God is housed in the human body and members' words are God's words. Hearing and speaking the word of God invokes love, blessing, and healing. Sustaining and reciprocating love between believers as speakers and hearers critically underlies faith during illness and suffering. In daily life, church members strive to help each other not to capitulate to pains in hardship or illness.

Social inequalities are experienced in gendered and generational relationships within domestic housed spaces. AIDS, as a slow-killing disease, has placed heavy demands on women's domestic labour as nurses and mourners. Nursing is hard work, and both the sick and caregivers experience anxiety, frustration, sadness, and anger. Cultivating Tumelo enables caregivers not to express anger, even to disagreeable patients. Scorn and jealousy are injurious and negatively impact on ongoing relationships. Consequently, when praying or nursing, positive sentiments are strategically engaged to express love. Emphasis during visits to compounds or hospital is on the centrality of housing the spirit of the sick with prayers, songs,

and even dance, thus encouraging the sick not to despair. Caregivers exercise moral authority when providing for the sick, praying, preaching the word of God, and consoling the bereaved. The sick are compelled to avoid injurious sentiments and encouraged to bequeath love to their children, parents, and caregivers.

The core belief here is that the sentiments of the caregivers, the sick, and survivors affect the wellbeing of the people. The ambivalence fostered by inequality, mutual suspicions, and betrayals of trust, abandonment, abuse, and neglect demand loving through compassionate preaching. Funerals are occasions to re-evaluate social relationships because they force people to manage the consequences of their sentiments. When visiting the bereaved, mourners operate in the 'house of death', where their words and behaviour should encourage the forgetting of past wrongs and promote healing. Mourning etiquette mandates the recognition and negotiation of competing claims of love with consoling reassurances of expressed shared grief, thus promoting social reconciliation.

Communal acts of love care performed by relatives, churches, and burial societies involve financial contributions, providing and preparing food, and staying and enduring the cold night to console the bereaved.

Civility enables survivors to maintain overlapping ties of love and care to one another. Putting love into words is more socially necessary than truthful fear-inducing references to witchcraft or promiscuity. The ethos of avoiding 'ugly truths' encourages secrecy and denial to preclude the stigma resulting from AIDS – a disease closely associated with sex.

The book is silent, however, on how framing the AIDS epidemic risks as transgression, stigma, and punishment poses a challenge to all involved in AIDS prevention and treatment. The globally accepted public health practices of reducing HIV transmission and stigma frame the risk of AIDS as requiring openness to promote the values of faithfulness, dignity, respect, solidarity, and truth. The book does not deal with the issue of multiple epidemics in African countries depending on the perceptions of and incentives and capacities to deal with the crisis. Government policies advocating the collective good of eradicating AIDS require managing the interests of different communities which promote either helpful or risk-enhancing cultures. Botswana has one of the most extensive and well-funded antiretroviral treatment programmes, which is supported in civil society by cultural and religious leaders. Women's enthusiasm for antiretroviral treatment has reduced mother-to-child transmission and improved survival. However, antiretroviral therapy is not a magic bullet if infection and re-infection continue because men resist condom use and free HIV tests and counselling.

Baitshepi church is a localized response cultivating a culture of social and spiritual interdependence among poor urbanites, but it needs to be situated in the wider context of the active influence that Christian organizations have on international and local funding and responses to AIDS. Considering that Botswana is one of the beneficiaries of the President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), I expected an assessment of its Christian fundamentalist impact. Antiretroviral treatment gets a large segment of the funding, and chastity and fidelity are highly emphasized. Sex education and condoms are underfunded to curb promiscuity. This empathetic and non-polemical book's apparent lack of outrage will provoke new, creative, and sustainable ways of designing and implementing AIDS prevention and treatment policies.

Christine Obbo *Independent Scholar*

McCourt, Christine (ed.); foreword: Ronnie Frankenberg. *Childbirth, midwifery and concepts of time*. xviii, 260 pp., figs, tables, illus., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £45.00 (cloth)

This seventeenth volume in Berghahn's series on 'Fertility, Reproduction and Sexuality' adds a new thematic layer of depth to this excellent scholarly list of monographs and edited volumes exploring the multi-faceted cultural aspects of reproduction around the globe. What differentiates this volume from other works that discuss similar themes of modernity, medicalization, power, control, and resistance in childbirth from a socio-cultural perspective is that the authors focus specifically on conceptualizations of time and temporality in relation to childbirth, which they rightly argue are under-studied categories in the social science scholarship on reproduction. The main goal of the volume is to show how the anthropological study of beliefs about time, and the way time is managed, is integral to understanding birth in both biomedical and 'traditional' settings. The authors are nearly all midwives, some with professional training in anthropology and others with experience using ethnographic methods. Most are affiliated with institutions in the United

Kingdom, a factor that is felt in the Anglo-centric focus of many of the chapters, but the chapters include enough forays into other birth cultures to highlight cultural comparisons.

The book is formally divided into three parts, although I found it more useful to view the volume as split in two with the first four chapters being introductory and providing the necessary background information and conceptual tools to understand the discussions of time in relation to childbirth that follow in the remaining ethnographic chapters. Chapter 1 is a historical account of the shifting conceptualizations of time (traditional, modern, postmodern) and their impact on the management of childbirth. Chapter 2 introduces the ways anthropologists have been thinking about childbirth, laying out the theoretical perspectives, central concepts, and a few representative ethnographic works in this area. Chapters 3 and 4 explore the linear model of time progression in contemporary biomedical birth and how progress, duration, and time are measured and monitored during pregnancy and labour. The juxtaposition of two case studies representing contrasting models of time management in childbirth highlight the consequences of the linear biomedical model.

The ethnographic chapters that follow look at changes and reforms in Euro-American birth settings and at alternatives to the linear model of time management in labour. For instance, chapter 6 looks at a free-standing birth centre in the UK where midwives learned a non-linear time orientation which the author relates to as 'slow birth'. Chapter 7 then looks at the impact of different indigenous conceptual understandings of time as 'circular' on the practice of midwifery among a variety of Aboriginal cultural groups in Canada. The next two ethnographic chapters highlight the value of employing story and narrative in anthropological research on childbirth and time through the exploration of women's birth stories in the UK and in Iceland. The last two ethnographic chapters then nicely tie the linear management of time to women's experiences of breastfeeding, drawing on cases from the UK and Japan.

The book is consistently well written, the ethnographic data are rich, and anthropological concepts and perspectives are successfully used to provide important insights into the meaning of time in relation to childbirth. Nevertheless, I believe that anthropologists of reproduction will notice across the volume that important scholarship has not been cited. For instance, although the authors come from a midwifery perspective, they have overlooked important work on the anthropology of midwifery that could have supported their arguments. None of the introductory or ethnographic chapters cite any of the articles in the special issue of *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* **20**: **2-3** (2001), entitled 'Daughters of time', which was devoted to contemporary midwifery. Likewise, none of the chapters employ Robbie Davis-Floyd's useful concept of the 'postmodern midwife' or cite any of her articles or edited volumes on changes over time in Canadian, American, and Mexican midwifery, such as *Mainstreaming midwives: the politics of change* (2006) or *Reconceiving midwifery* (2004). This is despite the obvious familiarity of the authors with Davis-Floyd's earlier work on hospital birth, which is cited widely throughout the volume. Finally, I believe that feminist anthropologists might be struck, as I was, to see that the nearly all-female-authored chapters are preceded by a foreword authored by a distinguished male expert (Ronnie Frankenberg).

I believe that this book will be of interest to midwives and other childbirth practitioners as well as to sociologists and anthropologists of reproduction. I would recommend it for graduate courses in anthropology as an example of how one anthropological theme – time and temporality – can be applied theoretically to a wide array of ethnographic data on childbirth and infant care.

Elly Teman *University of Pennsylvania*

Sharp, Lesley A. *Bodies, commodities, and biotechnologies: death, mourning and scientific desire in the realm of human organ transfer*. xii, 129 pp., illus., bibliogr. New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 2007. £16.00 (cloth)

This slim volume is a revised version of three Columbia University Leonard Hastings Schoff Memorial Lectures. The author is a well-known medical anthropologist with research interests in organ transplantation and the anthropology of the body and with ethnographic experience in Madagascar and at home in the US.

The author concentrates her attention on three main themes: the idea of a good death and the management and memorializing of the dead; body commodities and the medical value of the human body and its parts; and the development of xenotransplant and bio-engineering technology.

Her discussion of these topics contains much of interest. She clearly knows the transplant

world well, and she is nicely sensitive to the vocabularies adopted in different zones of the transfer process. In addition, her review of attitudes towards the use of animal sources for organs and her account of driving forces in the bio-engineering industry are usefully informative.

No doubt partly owing to space constraints, the author restricts herself almost wholly to cadaveric organ donation within the United States. This seems a pity, since comparisons and contrasts with *inter vivos* transfers are well worth exploring by anthropologists. The transfer of organs (typically kidneys) between close kin has a great deal to tell us about kinship and marriage, especially given the typical combination of tissue mis-match and close emotional commitment between spouses in the West. Moreover, there are also intriguing comparisons to be drawn between such transfers and classic kinship institutions like levirate. More generally, the restriction to the United States also runs against the grain of the author's own characterization of anthropology as a comparative discipline, and the broad sweep of a couple of brief ventures into comparison leave one troubled by their blanket nature. Thus, she tells us that 'organ transfer is unthinkable to Malagasy', and suggests that nations with a 'strong socialist bent', like Sweden, gladly donate and meet their organ requirements. Some recent figures in fact seem to suggest that Sweden has a relatively low rate of donation per head of population despite considerable improvements.

It also seems regrettable that Sharp has restricted her discussion to legal practices within the United States as opposed to clandestine global commerce in body parts. Yet it appears that considerable numbers of US citizens participate in such commerce, and this might raise some useful questions for a general view of cadaveric organ transfers as 'gifts'.

In qualification of the above points, it is important to note that the lectures were prepared for a largely non-anthropological audience, and this, while not at all a bad thing in itself, understandably affects their value for professionals within the field. On several occasions when one's curiosity is roused by some interesting point, one is referred to her book *Strange harvest* (2006), and I suspect that this last will be a more satisfying read for anthropologists with research experience or simply an interest in the field.

Ray Abrahams *Churchill College, Cambridge*

Throop, C. Jason. *Suffering and sentiment: exploring the vicissitudes of experience and pain in Yap*. xx, 329 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. London, Berkeley: Univ. California Press, 2010. £16.95 (paper)

In this sophisticated monograph, C. Jason Throop invites us to explore what it is to experience pain and suffering in Yap. Combining the feel of a classic ethnography with theoretical deliberation and fine-grained case studies, this book reflects the culmination of engaged fieldwork and thorough analysis.

Throop conducted fieldwork in Yap for fifteen months spread over several years. Fieldwork comprised archival research, oral history, interviews, pile-sorting tasks, and observation. The text is well populated with the necessary Yapese terminology, which Throop takes care to define and contextualize.

Comprising an introduction, eight core chapters, and a conclusion, the earlier chapters lay the groundwork by describing the history of Yap, social practices, social structure, and local configurations of pain, suffering, and morality. These are illustrated with examples from everyday life. Pain and suffering in Yap are embedded within a constellation of themes, including hard work (*maruweel*), endurance (*athamagil*), and compassion (*rungur*) and the imperative to restrain outwards displays of emotion and expressions of suffering. Against this imperative, Throop reports that informants were relatively willing to discuss their pain, illness, and physical suffering, although reluctant to talk about psychological suffering. Their expressions of pain occupy a space within the hierarchy of social relationships.

The earlier chapters are most tangibly brought to life in chapters 7 and 8. Throop reflects briefly on the criticism that anthropology may 'flatten out' the lived experience of individuals by describing shared models or idioms, and these chapters provide balance to previous ones that focus more on shared knowledge rather than individual experience. Chapter 7 presents narratives of long-standing pain drawn from a series of interviews. These variously illustrate views about the causes of pain and the relationship between pain and endurance. For instance, Tina deliberates on the origins of her back pain, which she thinks may have related to childbirth, but contextualizes this within a life of hard work and suffering. Fal'aeg explains how his back and joint pain reflect an

accident and the late emergence of pain owing to hard work in his youth. Chapter 8 presents a single case study: the resetting of a young girl's (Tinag's) broken forearm by a local healer. Throop guides us to see how Tinag's extreme pain and suffering are framed as 'suffering for' rather than mere suffering, as her father iterates the need for her to endure through the extreme pain of the resetting of her arm. In a moving exchange between father, daughter, and healer, Tinag is implored to endure, and there is a focus on enduring in the moment so that she will once again be able to contribute to the work of the household and community in the future. The rhythm and repetition of Tinag's father's words and the appeal to the future underline the temporal nature of endurance and appeals to moral virtue. Throop is careful to acknowledge the challenges that people face when transforming pain into virtue, and the narratives and case study also show the complexities of this in action for those in pain as well as for those who are witness to pain.

Although these two chapters are perhaps the most immediately engaging in the book, they gain their gravitas from the preceding chapters. Read together we are able to see how pain and suffering are suffused with broader ideals. However, the concept of enduring such that suffering 'for' achieves a virtuous end is recognized in other contexts, perhaps most obviously in the pain of childbirth. In this book I would like to have read more about Yapese understandings of childbirth pain, which is only mentioned in passing. It is fair to say that Throop might have found this topic difficult to access, despite his work with female research assistants, but this seems like an important omission that may have provided central insight into Yapese life.

Throop concludes with a scholarly discussion of moral experience and suffering, drawing variously on pertinent literature, including the work of Husserl, Levinas, and Kleinman. This provides more theoretical elaboration about the experience and expression of pain and the complex challenges that pain and suffering bring to an individual's experience of the world and themselves. This book offers a deeply theorized yet sensitive exploration of the way that sensory pain is imbued with culturally embedded moral value. I read it with great interest. I would expect that academics with an interest in pain, suffering, ethical subjectivity, and the nature of virtue would do likewise.

Rachael Gooberman-Hill *University of Bristol*

Zhan, Mei. *Other-worldly: making Chinese medicine through transnational frames*. xiv, 240 pp., illus., bibliogr. London, Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2009. £58.00 (cloth), £14.99 (paper)

Other-worldly presents an anthropology of Chinese medical practice in Shanghai and San Francisco. Using case studies from her ethnographic work in clinics and schools, anecdotes from her own life, and a healthy dose of cultural theory, Mei Zhan argues that traditional Chinese medicine (at least since the twentieth century) is created through translocal encounters. After an introduction that lays out the theoretical apparatus of the work, three chapters explore some of the most common rubrics within which modern Chinese medical practice is understood (as a cosmopolitan practice, as a commodity that has been exported and rationalized, and as a marginalized source of 'miracles'), and three chapters depict the translation of Chinese medical knowledge across cultures, genders, and physical localities.

Here's the basic idea: traditional Chinese medicine emerges from 'translocal movements, displacements, and refigurations' that transcend geopolitical and cultural boundaries. Though it is typically idealized into a metonym of an authentic 'China', exoticized into a source of miraculous healing knowledge, or dismissed as a pseudoscientific Other, Chinese medicine is instead a constantly changing network of entanglements that is created and navigated through cultural travellers and translators: practitioners, patients, teachers, and students. This will surprise a reader who comes to the book having assumed that traditional Chinese medicine is an ancient and unchanging body of knowledge. Scholars of health and healing in China (especially those familiar with the work of Judith Farquhar, Elisabeth Hsu, and Volker Scheid), however, will have seen similar arguments before.

What is new here is the explicit framing of Chinese medicine within the language of translocality. In an effort to distance herself from 'assumptions of totality, transition, and transcendence' (p. 22) that typify accounts of the globalization of local knowledge, Zhan suggests that we understand Chinese medicine as a process of 'worlding'. What exactly 'worlding' involves is difficult to disentangle, but in this context it describes a way of imagining Chinese medicine as something constantly in the process of being created translocally by things and processes and people, rather than as an

entity that somehow pre-exists them. Zhan uses the discourse of 'worlding' to create a dialogue between scholarship on Chinese medicine and theories of global modernity, weaving together theoretical tools from science studies (largely instantiated here by Bruno Latour), medical anthropology, and critical theory.

The germinal relationship between the local and the global (or the individual and the universal) is a major concern of *Other-worldly*, even as Zhan attempts to replace these binaries with a discourse of translocality. This is the source of the book's greatest delights and most productive tensions. First, the delights: Zhan's prose is most gripping when she allows the individual travellers from her fieldwork to take over the story. Much more powerfully than the heavily theoretical exposition in the book, these characters illustrate the sort of conceptually and geographically translocal practice of Chinese medicine as they go about their daily business, mixing descriptions of *qi* with biomedical disease categories, using acupuncture needles along with x-rays, and negotiating among seemingly incommensurable bodily images and symptoms. The clinical encounter related in chapter 4 is especially fascinating stuff.

On further reflection, the very tensions that seem to mar Zhan's study after an initial reading actually strengthen its case. While the book succeeds in presenting a series of engaging anecdotal illustrations, the local cases do not quite come together as evidence to support the weight of Zhan's hypotheses about 'what we have come to call "traditional Chinese medicine" ' (p. 1) writ large. Though Zhan's argument likely holds in the contexts of Shanghai and San Francisco, *Other-worldly* often seems to treat Shanghai as a microcosm of China and California as an exemplar of the United States, taking these contexts as broadly representative while at the same time insisting on the particularity of the local culture in each place. Similarly, while Zhan's narrative effectively assumes the existence of an entity called Chinese medicine and the sorts of practices that constitute it (largely herbal medicine and acupuncture) across very different temporal and geographic frames, she explicitly rejects the idea that traditional Chinese medicine is a stable and static knowledge system (most saliently on pp. 94-5). Far from undermining the book, however, these instabilities actually work as an organic part of the argument itself: even as we try to identify them and use them, the central categories of any analysis are constantly shifting, coming into being, and disappearing.

The fact that *Other-worldly* embraces these difficult questions of identity, translation, and ontology at even the most basic level of scholarly practice is a mark of its great success. This is a book that rewards the critical and thoughtful engagement of its reader. It is worth your time and that of your graduate students.

Carla Nappi *Universty of British Columbia*

Method and theory

Carrithers, Michael (ed.). *Culture, rhetoric and the vicissitudes of life.* xi, 184 pp., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £35.00 (cloth)

Rhetoric is persuasive or wins its force among interlocutors, not by their talking past, but by their talking with or against each other, or through over-talking, out of turn, and even silencing themselves. At the simplest, in terms of rhetor or speaker and addressee, the addressee in successful rhetoric has to hear and be moved by the rhetor.

The drawn-out vicissitudes of publishing these essays from Ivo Strecker and Stephen Tyler's almost decade-long project of Rhetoric Culture, with its star-studded roster of 'academic heroes and heroines' (Michael Carrithers's and mine, too), have put at risk the essays' timely force and success in rhetoric. Part of the difficulty comes from having pieces split from a more impressive whole, the present volume being the second, concurrently published along with a first edited by Strecker and Tyler, *Culture and rhetoric* (2009). Fitting the pieces together has been more than daunting, given the great disparities in stance, from literary criticism of diaries (Nienkamp), to communications studies of hyperbole or war metaphor in the media (R. Cintron, B. Nerlich), to psychiatric or fictionalized rendering of diffuseness and trauma (S. Wiene), to ethnographic interpretation of irony, metaphor, and subtleties of the moral imagination (M. Carrithers, M. Biesele, F.G. Bailey, E. Basso, J. Fernandez).

Carrithers's editing in his preface and introduction, though skilful in the rhetorical art of narrating a plausible whole from disparate pieces, suffers from an irony, or what his contributor Ralph Cintron might call the hyperbole of late modernity. The introduction speaks of 'the rhetorical edge of culture', and

repeatedly invokes 'the new', five times in one paragraph alone (p. 8). In critical deconstruction, Cintron catches idiomatic expressions which crystallize a community's commonplaces, specifically expressions from American English such as 'the cutting edge', 'maintaining one's edge', 'edginess'. He conceptualizes a shift whereby rhetoric becomes 'rhetoricality, the pervasive and constantly produced force of language aimed to create newness in our world' (p. 141). Oddly enough, or ironically, Carrithers, on the new and the edge in rhetoric, and Cintron, on the same in rhetoricality, talk past each other, without mutual address in direct argument. Similarly, there is a muted disagreement between two of the volume's most influential contributors, James Fernandez and F.G. Bailey, who advance radically opposed visions of the argumentative and moral power of rhetoric.

The problem of presence has compounded the challenge for Carrithers as an editor who is a socio-cultural anthropologist interested in particularity and 'actual circumstances of use'. Overwhelmingly, direct observation of dialogue and dialogics, of both speaker and audience, is not in the driver's seat for this collection. The rhetoric addressed is more hearsay than heard-said, more from literary sources, diaries, fiction fragments, oratory texts, online archives of *The Guardian* or *The Times* (New York and London), the odd anecdote without a direct word from its main subject(s), than from first-hand cases.

There are two outstanding exceptions. Megan Biesele's chapter on 'Medical rhetoric in the US and Africa' is powerfully, even disturbingly, cogent about the rhetorical styles of a San healer and a big-city cancer doctor in Texas, because she argues from richly insightful intimacy, in one case with healing orations and in the other from herself enduring the professional making of a 'good death' for her own mother. The second exception is by Ellen Basso, on 'Ordeals of language', in which she illuminates how people suppress their own voices for rhetorical effect. Her argument is grounded in fine observation of Amazonian speech strategies by Kalapalo; it reaches comparatively to modernist examples from the USA and Europe, and is suggestive on the ways Japanese come to terms with their contrast in tropes of 'public' or 'revealed' and 'concealed' so as to be able to hold 'mutually contradictory modes of perception' at the same time.

Biesele's and Basso's exceptional chapters make one hopeful for more analysis of 'the concrete practices in discourse' in the rest of the volumes of this continuing series.

Richard Werbner *University of Manchester*

Engelke, Matthew (ed.). *The objects of evidence*. xi, 156 pp., bibliogrs. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009. £19.99 (paper)

Matthew Engelke's edited volume offers a fresh look at the perennially uncomfortable question: what makes ethnography good? Evaluation certainly stirs up some familiar ghosts: the scope of anthropological expertise, the authority of ethnographic representation, the utility of its claims. While the sheer tenacity with which anthropologists assert their intellectual specificity has quieted, if not exorcized, these methodological uncertainties, questions of value remain central to the ethnographic endeavour. What makes one heuristic better than another? To what extent is theoretical expansion empirically warranted? To borrow an analogy from the debate between Radcliffe-Brown and Lévi-Strauss: how many seashells do we have to collect to say something sensible about spirals?

Posed through the lens of evidence, these questions lose their existential edge. Notions of evidence cut across epistemic cultures; to suggest that anthropologists organize information into arguments is not to declare the discipline a science, an artform, or a species of philosophy. Evidence is inextricably linked to what ethnographers *do*; it anchors the problem of knowledge in practice, rather than in the conundrums of Western hermeneutics. Thus, despite the radical reflexivity of its subject, *The objects of evidence* forgoes the isolationist defence of ethnography in favour of a pragmatic elaboration of a 'boundary object' to be shared by the humanities, social sciences, medicine, and the law.

In keeping with the spirit of intellectual exchange, the volume is wide in its scope, ranging from Maurice Bloch's erudite reflections on the cross-cultural significance of vision as a vehicle for truth, to Christopher Pinney's finely grained analysis of the documentary photography of nationalist struggle in colonial India. The materials presented by the chapters defy a simplistic analytical synthesis, but Matthew Engelke has identified four key cross-cutting themes. The first two speak to ethnographic comprehensiveness: the *scale* of our analytical units (winks or life-worlds?) and the relationship they pose between *quantity and quality*. Some chapters confront the problem of

anthropological holism directly: for instance, Charles Stafford's and Anthony Good's discussions of the corroborative potential of anthropological evidence for psychologists and lawyers, respectively. However, all authors engage with the problem of abstracting significant relationships from complex material. The normative consequences of that interpretative selection are taken up by the second set of core themes, *certainty* and *intention.* The former considers evidence as an aspect of disciplinary integrity: how anthropologists not only produce but also confirm knowledge. This topic inspires some creative analogical reasoning. While Stefan Ecks's chapter on treating depression in India pursues the methodological significance of broader evidentiary trends for anthropology most explicitly, a number of contributors turn to our ethnographic sources for models of certitude. The *intention* of anthropological evidence is, then, as much a question of its normative investment as of interpretative elasticity; our theories must be proportionate to the truth claims and representative politics of those we study.

The objects of evidence was first published as a special issue of the *JRAI*, but hangs together nicely as a book. Beyond their thematic resonance, several of the chapters also intimate an emergent theoretical repertoire concerned with the distribution of agency, and the ontological interpenetration of things, spirits, and humans. Webb Keane's semiotic analysis of the interplay of the material and immaterial aspects of religious belief and Martin Hollbraad's account of divination as a task of transformative definition or *infinition* are particularly compelling in this regard. While theoretically dense, these chapters manage to communicate some of anthropology's urgency, which is somewhat understated in the introduction. If anything characterizes ethnographic research it is anxiety – the fear of leaving the field too early or going to sleep too soon. This desire to grasp the present seems to have less to do with the quantity of empirical material than its liveliness – anthropologists are intensively entangled with their objects. The interplay between engagement and distance, hesitation and resolve, takes a greater degree of moral positioning than *The objects of evidence* seems to let on.

Where this volume is successful is in transforming the problem of evidence into a productive inquiry. *The objects of evidence* forces anthropologists out of their reliance on reflexive analysis as a bulwark against postmodern incoherence, on the one hand, and the demands of an increasingly evidence-conscious political culture, on the other. Developing a language of evidence within anthropology reinforces the discipline's liminal position and enhances its conceptual originality. Asking 'how evidence works in and for the discipline of anthropology in its generation of knowledge' (p. 3) inspires empirical opportunities, not epistemological unease.

Ann Kelly *London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine*

Ingold, Tim & Jo Lee Vergunst (eds). *Ways of walking: ethnography and practice on foot*. xi, 205 pp., figs, illus., bibliogrs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008. £55.00 (cloth)

In recent years we have become accustomed to coupling 'mobility' with notions of speed, acceleration, time-place compression, and global flows. The idea of 'mobility' has become a facet, not so much of movement itself, as of the effects of movement, evidenced in the reconfiguration of globalized spatial relationships; the emergence of 'non-places' and other transit points of supermodernity; and an awareness of the imagined quality of places. As the focus shifts from place to displacement, and 'places' themselves sometimes seem to be on the point of dissolving, we are frequently left with a sense of heightened mobility which is curiously devoid of the materiality or physicality of movement.

A stroll through the papers brought together by Tim Ingold and Jo Lee Vergunst provides a welcome change of tempo from the default mode of globalized headlong dash, to the pedestrian pace which actually characterizes the mobility of most people in the world most of the time, some people all of the time, and all of us some of the time. Not that the global dimension is missing from these accounts of walking, which were first presented at the three-day 'walking seminar' held at the University of Aberdeen in 2005. The global is present, not only in the intimations of the power relations and encroachments on habitat which increasingly constrain movement of people and their animals for whom walking is a means of livelihood (see, e.g., the chapter by Gooch on the pressures on the transhumance of buffalo herders in the Himalayas), but also in the contrast between anthropology as globalized profession – characterized by attendance at international conferences and seminars, mobility

within a globalized jobs market, and, traditionally at least, fieldwork far from 'home' – and local practice, much of which, as several contributors note, involves walking and talking with informants 'in the field'. Fieldwork, it emerges, shares a number of features in common with the walking life – including the anxiety of getting lost, injured, or, in the case of the walkers, described by Lorimer and Lund, who are 'collecting' the ascent of Scottish 'Munros' (peaks measuring more than 3,000 feet above sea level), failing to meet expectations.

The twelve chapters that follow the introduction are organized to offer a progression from the rural and wilderness environments of herders and hunter gatherers in Malaysia (Tuck-Po), the Canadian Northwest Territories (Legat), southern Africa (Widlok), and the Himalayas (Gooch); through the saint's day procession in an Andalusian village (Lund); to walking in a variety of urban settings, and by city-dwellers in the countryside. Two of these latter chapters take up the figure of the *flâneur*, transposing this (still, implicitly, male) figure to the subversive landscapes of industrial ruination (Edensor) or the complexities of the interchange stations on the Tokyo underground system (Lucas), and coming to opposing conclusions about the capacity of the walker to inscribe their narrative on the urban surface. Approaching the same topic from the opposite direction, the chapter by Lavadinho and Winkin explores efforts by urban planners in Geneva to remodel the environment in order to 'engineer enchantment' for pedestrians. The results seem far removed from the dissident pleasures of the urban *dérivistes* who are the model for Edensor and Lucas, and suggest a different kind of agency at work.

Despite the variety of ethnographic cases presented, numerous leitmotifs run throughout: the mutually constitutive nature of walking, metaphor, and narrative; the tactile physicality of walking; the ways in which the apprehension of the environment through the feet can supplement or even supplant the traditional emphasis on the visual (Olwig; Vergunst): and the consequent significance of walking as a form of embodied knowledge, whether among the Batek hunter-gatherers in the forests of Pahang (Tuck-Po), or the schoolchildren of Aberdeen who are taken out of the classroom for lessons on the streets (Curtis). Contemporary variations on 'the beating of the bounds' discussed by Olwig surface in the activities of the 'collectors' who set themselves the goal of climbing all 284 of Scotland's Munro peaks, in the process confirming their self-identification as Scots (Lorimer and Lund). The 'confluencers', described by Widlock, who use GPS and mobile technology to visit (and thus 'collect') actual points on the ground where notional lines of longitude and latitude converge are in many ways doing the same thing on a global scale. Thus the contrast with the way in which lines on maps act as material obstacles to the movement of the San, which Widlock brings out in his chapter, are a particularly forceful reminder of the stark realties of the power relationships which walking also embodies.

Whilst each chapter in itself offers an intriguing ethnographic insight into the ways of walking, the collection as a whole opens up into a rich, engrossing, and highly enjoyable conversation.

Julie Scott *London Metropolitan University*

Leaf, Murray J. *Human organizations and social theory: pragmatism, pluralism, and adaptation*. xiv, 244 pp., figs, tables, illus., bibliogr. Urbana: Univ. Illinois Press, 2009. $50.00 (cloth)

Society and culture are not underlying causal realities that come to be manifested in social organization: it is the other way around. Society and culture are epiphenomena: 'projections of the organization process' (p. vii). What is important is what is observable not what is purportedly hidden. This is the (Wildean) clarion call that begins Murray Leaf's new, ambitious, and learned book. It intends to offer a new paradigm for social analysis: comprehensive, descriptively accountable, testable in detail, and immediately applicable to pressing issues of social and economic policy. Human beings *think*, they *interact symbolically and practically*, and they *organize*: these three habitualities are interconnected and each component can only be understood through their recursive unity. Leaf's is a radical empiricism distinct from both positivism and postmodernism: beginning and ending with what is observable, as against philosophical dogma and hypothetico-deduction, on the one hand, and revelation-cum-ideology, on the other.

There are three universal observables of social organization, Leaf elaborates. First, no society has ever just one structure, a unitary social organization or culture; all are pluralistic, incoherent, containing multiple organizations based on distinct principles and values. Second,

these structures or cultures do not control us; we human beings use them to control one another and to accomplish common purposes, and we change them as our purposes and plans do (societies do not evolve on their own). Third, social organizations can be understood as the use by members of indigenous ideas, concepts, resources, and practices for the purpose of orientating themselves towards the future. Empiricism, as well as being a form of disciplinary analysis (dating back to Hellenist Scepticism), is but another name for experimentalism, which amounts to a universal human proclivity for anticipation.

Let me give a flavour of Leaf's authorial voice: 'Groups are aggregates of people whose members can be named but whose mutual relations cannot be. Organizations are people under some common group name and with mutually adjusted behavioral expectations. Both of these are both emic and etic' (pp. 15-16). Human beings as participants in organizations are conscious of mutual adjustments in their behaviours, conscious of commitments to fellows and expecting the arrangement to persist for a specifiable time: 'The members of self-recognized groups may or may not form organizations, but an organization will always define a group'. Hence: 'Individual organizations are ongoing consensual constructions of those who conceptually place their interactions within them. They exist in and through interacting human imaginations backed by sanctions rooted in interests' (p. 38). When two or more individuals or groups have, by means of communication, established mutual adjustments of behaviour they have created an organization.

Empirical focus on human social organization affords Leaf insight into many other aspects of the human condition. We have, for instance, both one and many *selves*. We have selves defined in relation to others in organizational contexts and part-and-parcel of our creating these multiple contexts; and we have singular personal selves constructed as a locus to house our organizational selves. Organizations represent alternate ways in which individualized selves obtain or deploy resources. *Situations*, meanwhile, are formed by people trying to get something done. The situation is not created by the ideas used to define it, moreover; it is created by the individuals using those ideas. *Culture* is the symbolic expression of structure or organization. It embodies rational foresight and choice, and manifests formally structured systems. Having said this, some cultural expression can be fictional, chartering organizational behaviour not in an authoritative way but an oblique way.

In conclusion Leaf provides three negative and three positive rules (p. 219). Society is not an obscure, organic, cognitive, or economic unity lying beyond observable social behaviour. Society and its organizational structures do not encompass us – as something we move through and in which we have positions and relations; our relationships are not enduring versions of our ephemeral behaviours. Instead, it is our immediate purposes that are firm; our organizational structures are only as firm as our ability to create an ongoing consensus in their name; our relations and values are talking points for forming the behaviours we would place under their aegis.

This is not an easy book. Leaf seeks to exemplify his theorizations by way of a number of examples, including Sikh wedding ceremonial, the New Deal, computer modelling of emergent complex systems, and John Marshall's 1958 film on the Kalahari Bushmen, *The hunters*. He ranges widely in his philosophical referencing, including Locke, Kant, Smith, Mill, James, Russell, Dewey, Mead, Popper, and Rorty. And he relates his anthropology in particular to the work of Bailey, Barth, Boserup, Fischer, Leach, Read, and Schneider. Leaf claims that we need empirical analysis of human organization comparable to Mead's 1930s' work on selfhood – understood as a consequence of interaction and communication. Adapting modern information theory, one can understand the ordinary unmediated communication that everyday creates and maintains human organization. How Leaf's book communicates its claims towards the organization of a committed audience could represent a kind of test case.

Nigel Rapport *University of St Andrews*

Religion, myth, and cosmology

du Boulay, Juliet. *Cosmos, life, and liturgy in a Greek Orthodox village*. xvi, 462 pp., figs, illus., bibliogr. Limni, Evia: Denise Harvey, 2009. £35.00 (cloth), £22.00 (paper)

Rather than being an ethnographic account (as in the author's *Portrait of a Greek mountain village*, 1974, and numerous articles), this book is a meditation on the metaphorical relationship between the working lives of members of a

Greek subsistence farming community, and the Orthodox Christian annual cycle of feasts, fasts, and observances. It is based on roughly forty months of fieldwork in 1966-8 and 1970-3, and on informants' accounts, as well as on the author's knowledge of Orthodoxy theology and liturgy. This allows a much more systematic account than any of the villagers could give (as the author readily admits), but one which the fieldwork underpinning the discussion allows to be tempered with the villagers' earthy realism: 'God can answer prayers with a "bum-fart" '.

The analysis of the symbolism of earth and features of the landscape, of water, of the sun, moon, and stars, shows that all have their positive and negative features in a categorical hierarchy. Not surprisingly, as many of the anthems, prayers, and chants used in the liturgy were written by those living in the Mediterranean area, there are extensive parallels and resonances between the liturgical and the agricultural year. The analysis continues with a discussion of household and family, and of the implications of the rules which encourage marriage outside a particular range of kinship relations, illuminatingly illustrated by reference to embroidery motifs. Other topics covered include the rituals associated with death and mourning, the life of saints ('god-bearers'), and the relationship between human beings and God, Christ, and the Virgin Mary (with God Himself sometimes powerless, as the villagers say, in the face of Fate). A recurrent image in village cosmology which is strongly brought out is that of the round dance, which appears in the symbolism of gifts, of marriage and its rules, of twisted candles lit beside corpses. This movement must always be to the right, anti-clockwise, going forward and moving on to new states of being, relationships, and places. At all celebratory events, another line of dancers will be waiting their turn, and must eventually be made way for, just as the older generation must retire for the younger generation to take over.

The bulk of the text is written in a generalizing ethnographic present, the only reflexive discussion appearing in the introduction. Analogies and metaphorical correspondences are pushed as far as seems possible and inconsistencies and problems of interpretation are in many cases met head on and fully discussed. But while this examination and discussion do not shy away from mess and pettiness, it is odd that no reference is made to the author's article on 'Lies, mockery, and family integrity' in *Mediterranean family structures* (1976), which examines deceit, cheating, and similar darker aspects of village life more thoroughly.

There are also a number of other stumbling blocks for the reader. Not only is the fieldwork several decades in the past, and thus the account of village cosmology a reconstruction, but also many of the beliefs and customs which are detailed and integrated into the analysis were not even being held or practised during the first period of fieldwork, but were described by older informants. In addition, this is a village traumatized by the events of the Greek Civil War, and by consequent forced evacuation which introduced villagers to the less harsh life-styles of those living further down the mountain. There is no mention of a village school, or of teachers and their role in inculcating 'Christian Hellenism' into their pupils, or of young men's military service, often a profoundly eye-opening experience for those from rural backgrounds. The village world presented here is self-contained and (almost) self-sufficient. Occasionally, in accounts of festivals, meetings with people from other villages are mentioned, and the marriage rules force the villagers to seek their spouses elsewhere, sending out sisters and daughters to other villages and bringing in brides from outside.

As a reconstruction of what might have been at one time the worldview of a Greek peasant society, this is an extraordinarily sympathetic and nuanced account, full of illuminating insights, but the 'cosmology' here is outside both time and history. In essence an ethnographic theology (in the tradition of Evans-Pritchard's *Nuer religion*, 1956), the book presents the life of the villagers and the liturgy of the church with respect and affection, as inextricably linked, pictured as in the book jacket's cover illustration: a cosmic dance of great beauty and intricate pattern, captured in an eternal instant.

Margaret E. Kenna *Swansea University*

Farley, Helen. *A cultural history of tarot: from entertainment to esotericism*. xii, 270 pp., figs, tables, bibliogr. London, New York: I.B. Tauris, 2009. £52.50 (cloth)

For about forty years the tarot has been the subject of many works, most of them written from an esoteric point of view. Their authors seek to understand a 'hidden message' that they believe is embedded in the cards, which they hold to be 'hermetic' pictures. In this flow of publications a few books have tried to sort out

what is pure fancy and what relies on historical facts and documents. Prominent among these publications is the work of Prof. Sir Michael Dummett, whose *The game of tarot* (1980) was the first of many contributions devoted to illuminating the history of the subject.

The more scholarly works being unfortunately not easy to access, it is good news to have a handy book that proposes a thorough treatment of this sensitive area. The author, a lecturer in studies in religion and esotericism at the University of Queensland, sketches the history of tarot in five of the six chapters: 'Origins and antecedents', 'Renaissance Italy and the emergence of tarot', then 'The transformation of tarot into an esoteric device', 'Across the Channel to England', and 'Tarot and the New Age', which sum up the recent theories put forward by historians like Dummett and others.

Farley correctly reminds her readers that playing cards came first (in the late fourteenth century), and that tarot is a variation stemming from the ordinary pack, with the addition of a special, superior series of 'trumps' (from Italian *trionfi*, the earliest name of the game), a derivation which seems to have occurred in the early fifteenth century. She also rightly recalls that tarot was (and still is) primarily a card game.

According to Farley it was in Milan, at Filippo Maria Visconti's court, that tarot was 'invented', a theory which she is not the first to put forward, but that she over-simplifies somewhat. Then, jumping over centuries, neglecting the development and spread of the game in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, hardly mentioning the celebrated though misleadingly named 'Tarot de Marseille', and disregarding the major graphic change that occurred in eighteenth-century Germany, when the traditional Italian suit signs were swapped for French suit signs and the strong medieval allegories were substituted for profane subjects, Farley focuses her three last chapters on the rise and spread of the occult tarot from eighteenth-century France.

In the meantime, in a sixth chapter entitled 'An alternative explanation of tarot symbolism' (chap. 3 of the book), the author offers her own view of the much-scrutinized symbolism of the cards (trump cards only). Far from falling into the trap of the usual 'kabbalistic' interpretation of the cards, Farley remains at a simple, direct, historical level. Taking for granted that the tarot was invented in Milan, and that the three best preserved sets, attributed to Bonifacio Bembo and dating from 1442-50, are the true prototypes, the author explains that the trumps 'formed a particular narrative of Visconti history, culminating in the glory of Milan as evidenced in the World trump' (pp. 91-2).

Although this chapter is central and fills in no less than a quarter of the actual main text, it is the least convincing chapter of Farley's book. First this is because it is far from certain that tarot as we know it was designed in Milan. In fact it is still a matter of lively discussion among historians. This prejudice leads the author to exclude the other early traditions of tarot in Italy – as established by Dummett: Bologna, Ferrara, Florence. She consequently neither presents nor discusses the other illuminated cards that are nearly contemporary to the Bembo sets but were clearly not made for Milanese patrons. Disappointingly, Farley does not even attempt to make out a programme or an overall arrangement of the series.

On its very first page the author boldly claims that 'this book forms the first comprehensive cultural history of the tarot deck and its imagery' – a statement that is repeated on the jacket. This claim is misleading. This 'cultural history of the tarot deck' is not *comprehensive* at all: it leaves aside too much – it passes over in silence (as noted) the strong presence of tarot in other northern Italian cities which had their own traditions, like Bologna, Ferrara, and Florence; the development of tarot in Europe between the fifteenth and the eighteenth centuries; the evolution of the game; its decline during the nineteenth century; and so on.

This otherwise poorly illustrated but expensive book is much too focused on the esoteric developments of tarot to be the 'comprehensive cultural history' it promises. It is not bad, it draws on good reference books (referred to in no less than 1,675 footnotes!), although mostly written by people for whom the author has contempt (p. 4), but it is extremely limited both in focus and in treatment.

Thierry Depaulis *Independent Scholar*

Lastra, Yolanda, Joel Sherzer & Dina Sherzer. *Adoring the saints: fiestas in Central Mexico*. 211 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Austin: Univ. Texas Press, 2009. $55.00 (cloth)

Fiestas are a central element of Mexican popular culture. Octavio Paz, countless anthropologists, and many other commentators on Mexican

affairs have analysed the purpose and meaning of fiestas in the life of Mexico. *Adoring the saints* is less a new interpretation of this phenomenon than a holistic, synthetic ethnographic treatment of the multiple dimensions and activities that comprise the fiesta. The volume, because of its unique comprehensiveness, will become the new guidebook for anthropological researchers of Mexican fiestas.

Eager, iconoclastic graduate students will find little in this book to whet their appetite for theoretical myth-busting. Lastra *et al.* accept the notion that the fiesta represents the transhistorical essence of Bonfil's Deep Mexico. At the heart of the fiesta lie oppositions between indigenous and Hispanic identities, Mesoamerican languages and Spanish, the profane and sacred, order and disorder, inside and outside, tradition and change, and life and death. These core cultural motifs are expressed through dances, spiritual ceremonies, elaborate costumes, musical events, rich foods, processions, dramas, fireworks, and other activities that occur over many days. The fiesta performances are often raucous, vibrant, and idiosyncratic.

Lastra and the Sherzers focus their ethnographic lens on the patron saint fiestas of two intertwined communities: Cruz del Palmar and San Luis de la Paz, Guanajuato. Both towns have indigenous roots (Otomi in Cruz del Palmar, Chichimec in San Luis de la Paz) and have participated in each other's ritual venerations of their respective patron saints for centuries. The authors' encyclopaedic knowledge of the town's customs and their portrayal of the festive events' remarkable richness (incorporating the traditions of at least four American indigenous cultures mixed with Mediterranean and Spanish ways) are a primary virtue of the book. They accomplish their goal of rendering 'the dynamism and creativity of patron saint fiestas, their visual, aural, kinetic and verbal features, to convey the flavor and taste of these fiestas'.

The authors consider patron saint fiestas a site of local struggles to defend cultural patrimonies against the forces of industrialization and globalization. While they view the fiestas as expressions of indigenous, ancient identities (as well as representations of the Spanish conquest), they recognize the creative, evolving character of fiesta customs and practices. Fiestas display the heterogeneity of local identities and aesthetics. The main focus of the book is ultimately expressive culture and relatively little attention is paid to the political economy in which fiestas are embedded.

Lastra *et al.* are optimistic that patron saint fiestas will not be trampled underfoot or wantonly distorted by consumerism and the myriad faces of 'modernism'. Surely, the survival and regeneration of the fiestas over five centuries is a mighty accomplishment. I wish I shared the authors' faith. Yet as I peruse a modern Mexico devastated by drug cartel violence, economic crises, ecological destruction, and creeping cultural and linguistic genocide, I wonder if the old school ethnographic community study of essential cultural traits and rituals is up to the task and whether a 'deep Mexico' will prevail. Twenty years ago, fiestas in the Isthmus of Tehuantepec already had been heavily co-opted and commodified by beer and liquor distributors. Moreover, hyper-media exposure and the pervasive intrusion of electronic communication devices into social life may transform fiestas into garish postmodern reality spectacles.

But this remains to be seen. In the meantime, *Adoring the saints* is a superb description of and insight into the wealth of popular religious belief and practice in Mesoamerica.

Howard Campbell *University of Texas-El Paso*

Vilaça, Aparecida & Robin M. Wright (eds). *Native Christians: modes and effects of Christianity among indigenous peoples of the Americas*. xii, 252 pp., maps, illus., bibliogrs. Farnham, Burlington: Ashgate, 2009. £55.00 (cloth)

The editors have made a significant contribution to the literature on Christianity as practised or understood by indigenous peoples of the Americas. Most chapters consist of localized case studies, drawing on regionally based literature. While the quality and focus of the chapters are not consistent, the authors (most explicitly the editors in their introduction and Robbins in his afterword) generally suggest that Christian conversion is more effectively analysed in terms of indigenous perspectives.

My main criticism of this book is that it is not regionally balanced. Nine of eleven chapters focus on South America; six on Amazonia. The two chapters on North America each focus on a region of Canada. There is no information on contemporary North American Indians and no material on Mesoamerica. Furthermore, one Amazonianist (Kapfhammer) touches on Christianity only tangentially. It is hard to

understand why his chapter was included instead of one by, say, Jean-Guy Goulet, John Barker, Michael McNally, Virginia Garrard-Burnett, or Carlos Garma.

Like the Amazonian chapters, those on Canada include both one of the strongest in the book and one of the weakest. Greer's comparison of seventeenth-century Jesuit missions stands out, generally to its own disadvantage, as the book's only purely historical, and only comparative, as well as shortest, chapter. This brief contribution fails to use systematic comparative research, which could be of interest to generalists. Yet it will add little to the existing understanding of specialists on Jesuit missions in New France or Paraguay. Much more successfully, Laugrand and Oosten explore historical conversions to Christianity in the Central Arctic, suggesting both similarities between shamanic practices and Christianity as well as disjunctures. The latter include conversion rituals devised and propagated by Inuit themselves, in which people collectively violated food taboos to accept Christ. In this well-documented chapter, the authors also examine the relevance of their findings to contemporary Christianity among the Inuit, for example suggesting that Pentecostalism strongly resembles shamanism.

The editors also affirm that shamanism remains the best lens for understanding Christianity among indigenous peoples. As such, the dominant theoretical framework in the book is perspectivism, wherein deixis and metamorphosis are salient as relations with the other are understood partly in terms of a predator-prey dichotomy. Excepting Wright, each author focusing on the Amazon (Vilaça, Gow, Grotti, Bonilla, and Kapfhammer), as well as Laugrand and Oosten, Vilaça and Wright, and Robbins, cite perspectivist works of Eduardo Viveiros De Castro, Carlos Fausto, and/or Vilaça herself. Thus, Vilaça's chapter, setting forth a perspectivist vision of conversion, is likely the book's central contribution. She uses a Wari myth to demonstrate that conversion can be seen as continuity with indigenous thought, inasmuch as indigenous thought is orientated to capturing the perspective of the other. Although Vilaça's chapter is the only one citing Robbins, her perspectivism (implying cultural continuity to some extent) is somewhat challenging to Robbins's thesis that Christian conversion consists of rupture, rather than continuity. Vilaça's argument is supported by Gow's chapter, in which the concept of 'Christian' (a spritual convert) is exploded in favour of 'Christian' (an indigenous category distinguishing humans from animals). Gow further argues that historical understandings of conversion be subordinated to ethnographic ones. Gow, Vilaça, and other contributors thus suggest that indigenous perspectives on Christianity are highly complex and situated. In turn, Robbins offers a thoughtful afterword in which he fine-tunes many of his previous ideas about the degree to which Christianity, as a universalist doctrine, may nevertheless be shaped by indigenous worldviews.

Other theoretical or topical groupings characterize smaller sets of chapters, sometimes in combination with perspectivist approaches. Bacigalupo, Grotti, and Bonilla focus on the role of embodiment, sexuality, and/or healing as critical factors in conversion, allowing comparison between Christianity and shamanic traditions. Similarly, like Vilaça and other contributors, Bacchiddu focuses on the collective nature of conversion and reconversion as a process of identity change. Wright, Kapfhammer, and Ferraro focus on money and development as religious factors. The former two use Weberian assumptions rather uncritically in discussing Protestantism.

This book's introduction, afterword, and best chapters transcend theoretical and regional boundaries to promote a cohesive vision of indigenous Christianities from multiple perspectives. This material confirms the potential for integration of two research fields: anthropology of Christianity and Amerindian spirituality. The editors (with Robbins) also push tentatively for a comparative project beyond the Americas (mainly to Oceania). I can only wish that they would have first attempted a deeper comparative study *within* the Americas through this book, as the work of Fausto, like that of Claude Lévi-Strauss, suggests would be beneficial.

Clinton N. Westman *University of Saskatchewan*

Social anthropology

Aziz, Barbara Nimri. *Swimming up the Tigris: real life encounters with Iraq*. xx, 314 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Gainesville: Univ. Press of Florida, 2007. $24.95 (cloth)

Barbara Nimri Aziz, a freelance journalist, host of a radio show, and trained anthropologist, has written a book composed of some twenty-five

vignettes based on her experiences in Iraq and interviews with Iraqis in Jordan and the United States conducted between the period of 1989 and the 2003 invasion of Iraq. The focus of the book is essentially on what happened to Iraqis under the UN sanctions which is done mainly through presenting personal accounts to highlight the practical and pragmatic difficulties faced by the country as a whole. There are several short chapters which the author dedicates to a more general and political account of the suffering of Iraqis under sanctions in which she quite explicitly attacks her own (US) government's role in its imposition. There are theses put forward throughout the text which suggest and at times claim that Western governments had as their aim to attack the fabric of Iraqi society, not merely Saddam and the Ba'athist apparatus.

The personal accounts attempt to put a 'human face' to the deprivation endured by the Iraqi population during those unimaginably difficult years. I must admit I found several of these accounts to be quite compelling and touching. There are difficult emotions unveiled when a family is relieved to have some of its members return to the country to be together for the bombing of Baghdad in 1991. Ambiguous figures emerge such as an Iraqi artist who leaves his young, pregnant wife to study art in California. With the outbreak of war in 1991, he turns his back on his family and country to begin a new life, only later and reluctantly to bring the son he has never seen to the United States when he is in his late teens to save him from the violence of Baghdad after the 2003 invasion. There is also the quite sad story of the Iraqi ambassador to the United States who is left after the freezing of Iraq's international assets in 1991 with no embassy, hardly any money, and is ejected from his expensive Manhattan apartment; both sidelined by his host country and marginalized by his own country's government.

The accounts which are focused on Iraq deal mainly with the ongoing battle of many Iraqis to survive physically, emotionally, and intellectually through the sanction years. Examples of such stories range from a scientist who tries to communicate her research findings outside of Iraq only to be repeatedly ignored by the scientific community by virtue of her being in Iraq, to a resilient woman who helps to run a yearly international conference on poetry and the arts in Baghdad in order to keep Iraqi intellectuals in contact with the outside world.

For all the virtues of the text, there are, however, quite serious shortcomings. Aziz takes a strong political stance against the Western governments that supported sanctions on Iraq, particularly the USA. Indeed, there seems a stark polarization between the heroic Iraqis valiantly fighting sanctions by trying to maintain intellectual and social life and the reckless American government which is blind to the suffering of Iraqis. There are also a number of quite general, unsubstantiated claims about the American government which tend towards conspiracy theory. Aziz's claims may all be true or not, but references to Ba'athist oppression is all but missing, and Saddam Hussein in the text is a bit player in the suffering of Iraqis. Also, the author claims at times that sectarian divisions within the country were barely an issue before the invasion, yet much of the vital resources from the mainly Shi'ite South were diverted to the Sunni regions and neighbourhoods in the centre of Iraq and Baghdad; massacres were inflicted again and again on Shi'ites just for being Shi'ites, and few Shi'ites rose to prominent positions within the country, though they are by far the majority in Iraq. In many respects this is a naïve and quite blinkered text historically and politically, though when Aziz concentrates on the struggles of individuals and families surviving the sanctions years she has some interesting insights.

Hayder Al-Mohammad *University of Kent*

Lowenstein, Tom. *Ultimate Americans: Point Hope, Alaska: 1826-1909*. xxix, 351 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Fairbanks: Univ. Alaska Press, 2008. $49.95 (cloth)

This volume is an account of the founding of Port Hope, an Iñupiat settlement in northwestern Alaska, based primarily on the experiences of two concrete individuals. Using interviews with contemporary Iñupiat elders, an extensive survey of previously unpublished archival manuscripts, and a summary of the published English-language literature, it is the most authoritative account of this community and one of the richer ethnohistorical accounts of the relationships between settlers and Iñupiat.

The work consists of twenty-seven short chapters, organized chronologically, illustrating significant events leading to the establishment of a built community on this windswept peninsula opening out onto the Chukchi sea. Although framed as an account of Iñupiat-settler

relationships generally, the study focuses on the life-histories of two individuals: Ataŋauraq, a mercurial Iñupiat leader, and John B. Driggs, a 'bohemian' missionary. The biographical details of these two individuals take up at least half of the chapters. In between these two biographies, Lowenstein provides the reader with excellent chapters giving details of economic relations, the earlier history of contact, and details of the health and spiritual life of the local population. There are discrete sections on the founding of the trading community Jabbertown, the history of commercial whaling, and a very interesting set of chapters on the millenarian *uivvaqsaat* movement which swept through the area at the end of the nineteenth century. The latter is supported with a special section in the bibliography. Although advertised as a complete account of Iñupiat and settler relationships, the book focuses on the period 1867-1905, corresponding to the arrival of American whalers and missionaries following the purchase of Alaska. There are three short appendices providing data and a discussion of the 1908 census, a short description of the traditional *qalgi* dwellings on the peninsula, and a speculative account of the reasons why the missionary Driggs was averse to commercial trading.

For anthropologists, the unique quality of the volume lies in Lowenstein's parenthetical comments on Iñupiat society, wherein he editorializes on possible misunderstandings of Iñupiat ritual in the diary of the missionary or speculates on the reasons for the Ataŋauraq's outrageous behaviour towards his kinsmen (and charming behaviour towards the settlers). Knowing Lowenstein's long-term connection to the community, these insights seem authoritative. Nevertheless, there often seems to be little direct support in the primary texts for his comments. The asides give the biographies a novelistic quality. Much stronger are the developed early biographies of the two main figures, which give us an insight both into their characters and into the contradictory colonial forces which pulled upon them. The book achieves a novelistic denouement with Lowenstein's observation as both men – the shaman and the missionary – shared diverging fates.

There is a second strong sub-theme in this history which will be of interest to anthropologists. Lowenstein is particularly evocative on explaining Iñupiat cosmology. He returns frequently to the story of the moon spirit – the social criticism of whom is compared to the sour judgments of the Protestant deity. The creation of the settlement as a built community is achieved with the visionary project of the missionary to re-bury the ancestral graves of Iñupiat in a new consecrated Christian cemetery.

The strongest part of the volume is the life-history of the missionary Driggs, which has been arduously built from a large number of sources and surveys very interesting topics, such as the reasons why Driggs chose his mission and the strategies that he used to induce students to his school. Lowenstein's account of the *interrelationship* between Iñupiat and settlers sticks very closely to the standard trope of sexual liaisons, the spread of disease, and the alternate suspicion of and embracement of Christianity. Given the author's work with oral history in the region it would have been nice to have had a proper ethnohistorical account of what both Iñupiat and settlers thought of their long-term relationship.

This book is part of a series on Iñupiat society by Lowenstein, the previous two being *The things that were said of them* (1990) and *Ancient land: sacred whale* (1993). In contrast to these earlier works, this book devotes much more attention to settler histories but weaves in Lowenstein's hallmark novelistic commentary.

David G. Anderson *University of Tromsø*

Mody, Perveez. *The intimate state: love-marriage and the law in Delhi*. xxiv, 308 pp., tables, fig., illus., bibliogr. London, New Delhi: Routledge, 2008. Rs 695 (cloth)

From what vantage-point should one address the question of romantic love in a society that is motored by kinship obligation? With what vocabulary might one discuss the disruption of structural kinship by inter-community unions? When might it be appropriate to abdicate the burden of these questions in the direction of the state? *The intimate state* prompts these questions, as it sets out to answer cognate ones.

Inter-community romantic unions are fecund anthropological complexes – going as they do against all manner of sociological grain and confronting the normative aesthetics of attachment. In the Indian context, the overriding desire to culminate such liaisons in marriage disrupt not just the motor of kinship but also the modernist severing of romantic love from sexuality and conjugality that the West is said to have achieved. Such unions call into being distinct forms of self-fashioning, which must entail a different set of expectations around

sexual intimacy and companionate conjugality from those held out in the promise of an arranged union. These ideals and expectations of intimacy in turn emerge from a complex interplay between forms of consumption and diverse technologies of sexual government.

The intimate state does not examine notions of intimacy or forms of self-fashioning that non-authorized unions idealize, produce, or are embedded in, nor indeed does it examine why marriage remains the crucial and powerful end-point after all. For Mody, the analytical pivot of romantic unions (or 'love-marriage couples', as she chooses to term them) is the exercise of *choice* by young people in selecting their partner with a view to a marriage. Mody offers a range of tales of woe wherein social difference is negotiated with varying and unpredictable success. The success of romantic liaisons in Delhi can be potentially threatened by all kinds of difference – between classes, communities, castes, neighbourhoods, or simply the opinion of two sets of recalcitrant adults on the sagacity of the union. Unsurprisingly, then, not all attempts at converting these romantic liaisons into a marriage bond and transforming a disembedded love-interest into a stable kin category are successful. The book explores the ways in which success is pursued and failure understood by the individuals concerned as well as by their wider kinship network.

In the high drama that characterizes these narratives, there are a number of agents at play, significant amongst which is state law, both as legislation as well as its institutional avatar. Here, law is understood chiefly in its instrumental capacity, and ethnographically examined in the ways it is invoked both to create and to solve problems for its various agents. Like intimacy, and even marriage, the category of law itself is not interrogated but rather left to reveal its cultural logic in the hands of these various agents. That the legitimacy of such marriages is made possible in and through law is deftly described in the account of some of the debates surrounding the promulgation of the Special Marriage Act in 1872. Mody goes on to illustrate 'strategies of justice' deployed by various individuals, including the uses and misuses of this Act by these so-called 'love-marriage couples'.

The book is thus most successful as an ethnography of contested agency, as it sketches the messy terrain that individuals navigate in order to transform their romantic love into a conjugal bond. Those vying for the efficacy of their agency include parental and familial authority figures, judicial intermediaries, pieces of legislation, competing love interests and alliance offers, political and community representatives, each of whom variously strive to 'colonize the life-world' of the protagonists. For Mody, agency takes on myriad forms – of graft and innocence alike – real and feigned victimhood, staged and genuine abductions, sly and naïve elopements, attempted and threatened suicides. Curiously, all this agency really amounts to a negative outcome, as it ends up bringing about a 'not-community', Mody's descriptive term to explain away the prolonged social liminality of the individuals in these marriages of choice. Considering the book has the term 'state' in its title, one might interrogate why the subjects of the Special Marriage Act of 1872 cannot or do not cohere under another collective – of citizenship, for example. Moreover, the fact that parental consent remains the primary contour of belonging that these individuals strive for begs a rigorous questioning of the limits of the disruption that these unions achieve in the motor of kinship after all.

Kriti Kapila *Wolfson College, University of Cambridge*

Selby, Martha Ann & Indira Viswanathan Peterson (eds). *Tamil geographies: cultural constructions of space and place in South India*. x, 326 pp., map, figs, tables, illus., bibliogr. Albany: SUNY Press, 2008. $80.00 (cloth)

How do verbal descriptions of land and space inform diverse social and aesthetic realities? This edited volume with contributions from historians, anthropologists, and scholars of religion seeks to answer this question with specific reference to Tamil-speaking South India. While there has been a growing interest in space and place (the editors name a number of recent works in anthropology as well as in cultural geography), the distinguishing feature – simultaneously a strength and a weakness – of this volume is the fact that it restricts itself, as it is aptly named, to *Tamil geographies*. So, although the volume is of more general conceptual and methodological interest, one feels that its main readership will be restricted to scholars of Tamilnadu or, at the most, India. In part, this is reflected in the introduction, which begins more generally but quickly narrows its focus to Tamilnadu. The methodological and conceptual advances signalled at the outset, then, do not find enough discussion devoted to

them, with the concomitant result that the non-specialist scholar might not feel the need to carry on with reading the chapters – this would be a loss as the papers, in addition to being rich and interesting in themselves, speak to each other in ways that show the productive possibilities of an interdisciplinary area studies approach.

As a scholar of Tamilnadu myself, I find that the restriction of the book's focus to the region allows for a wonderfully coherent volume that enables an exploration of continuities and disjuncture over time in the Tamil interdigitation of space, personhood, and emotion. So, for example, both Martha Ann Selby (focusing on Sangam poetry from the first five centuries CE) and Isabelle Clark-Decès (writing about contemporary Tamilnadu) show how the wasteland features as a device to indicate danger, transgression, and threat. Indeed, the exploration of the conceptual categories of *akam* (inside, interiority, private) and *puram* (outside, exteriority, public) runs throughout the volume, showing the remarkably resilient nature of these concepts and their creative use in a number of Tamil contexts. A brief discussion of individual chapters will illuminate this point.

Martha Ann Selby's chapter explores the poetic and aesthetic conventions of Sangam literature and suggests that the aim of the Sangam poets was the erasure of the split between self and landscape. To show this, she draws on a rich pool of examples of Sangam poetry, especially those referring to the desolation of mothers whose daughters leave them for a beloved or whose sons die in war. Norman J. Cutler continues Selby's interest in *akam* and *puram* categories through his examination of a medieval devotional poem whose hero is the lord Shiva and whose setting is the temple town of Tillai. Daud Ali's paper on Saivite and Vaishnavite cosmologies and Dennis Hudson's discussion of the city plan of Kanchipuram offer a rich glimpse into the configuration of sacred and political geographies in medieval India. Sacred and political geographies also form the subject of Diane Mines's paper, wherein she describes and analyses the walk taken by a low-caste man possessed by a god around the village whose boundaries are (re)made in the course of the walk, the god-man's talk, and his actions.

Inhabitants of uncultivated landscapes outside the village and their commentaries on agrarian relations form the subject of Indira Viswanathan Peterson's paper on an eighteenth-century dramatic genre of *kuravanci* plays. Susan Seizer, too, focuses on a marginal character, the Dancer, in contemporary Special Drama. Seizer's creative and detailed description of how the Dancer and her male protagonist (the Buffoon) inhabit the stage and thereby the social world is one of the highlights of the volume. The Dancer is a transgressive character precisely because she is the antonym of the 'good Tamil female', whose actions and movements are curtailed in a variety of ways. Maintaining one's reputation and the integrity of one's home and class status is the concern of the upper- and middle-class women in Sara Dickey's paper. Domestic servants are simultaneously necessary and threatening, and Dickey shows how servants' movements and comportment are strictly monitored by their employers especially within the home. Like the house, temples, too, are permeable spaces and need careful management. Samuel Parker's thought-provoking discussion of *akam* and *puram* spaces of Dravidian temples will interest any scholar who thinks about culture, tradition, continuity, and change.

Soumhya Venkatesan *University of Manchester*

Shokeid, Moshe. *Three Jewish journeys: through an anthropologist's lens.* 399 pp., bibliogr. Brighton, Mass.: Academic Studies Press, 2009. £49.50 (cloth)

This book deals with three journeys. More accurately, it focuses on three 'Jewish' journeys, though surely in these days of global 'hyper-immigration', the tales of the 'wandering Jew' and of his homecoming in the biblical 'promised land' as an Israeli citizen could be read as a fable of some more universal issues. The book also deals with the 'ethnographic lens' itself: that is, with the essentials of the ethnographic endeavour and the position of the professional anthropologist in the world, as a reporter and interpreter of the human condition.

Composed of seventeen essays, the book is divided into five parts, which include 'introduction', three 'journeys', and a last section on 'methodology'. The mentioned 'journeys' are the tales of Moroccan Jewish immigrants in Israel, Israeli emigrants in New York, and a tale of the gay and lesbian Jewish community in the US. Two of these journeys are 'external' or 'physical' ones (i.e. immigration from one country to another) and the third is an 'internal' or 'spiritual' journey (a religious journey, and one of self-exposure).

The editorial decision to compile all these ethnographic essays into three 'journeys' was a well-taken one. As Turner already taught us, some journeys could be much more than leaving one place and getting to another. These journeys become a transformative experience. The book itself ends with a revelation of the author's own transformative decision, that of changing his name, which took place in the 1970s, and relates to his first professional ethnographic research in the communal settlement Shokeida (chap. 17).

Being a collection of essays, this book also summarizes the author's fruitful academic career. Shokeid, an Israeli 'Sabra' anthropologist, was born in Tel-Aviv under the name Minkovich. In Tel Aviv University's Sociology and Anthropology department, where he taught most of his years (now Emeritus Professor), he became known to his many students for his insistence on the importance of fieldwork as a basis of a reliable ethnography, no doubt a legacy of his years as Max Gluckman's student in Manchester.

Shokeid's writing shows a good balance between 'postmodern' and 'old-fashioned' styles. While he adheres to a 'Malinowskian' style – that is, that the text should be based on data gathered in serious fieldwork – some chapters of the book are revealing and 'reflexive'. Another issue that he deals with in this book is the ethnographer's relationship with his own informants. Chapters 10 ('Studying one's own tribe') and 16 ('The cook, the native, the publisher and the ethnographic text') deal with these issues. In chapter 16 Shokeid raises our awareness to the changing face of modern-day ethnography, in times when informants are literate, and can read and comment back on monographs and papers, of which they are the heroes.

Over the course of years, some of the essays that appear in this book have proven to be not only important, but also 'ahead of their time'. The Israeli sociologist Uri Ram would probably agree with this, since he categorized Shokeid's researches on Moroccan Jewry in Israel (conducted in the 1960s) within the genre of 'revised functionalism', which he understood as the forebear of what he called the 'changing agenda' of Israeli social sciences that took place during the 1990s (Ram, *The changing agenda of Israeli sociology*, 1995).

For example, Shokeid's essay (chap. 7) describing the *Masoreti* (traditional) religiosity of Middle Eastern Jews in Israel (with a focus on Moroccan Jews) was a breakthrough in the understanding and analysis of the link between the *Mizrahi* (Oriental) ethnic identity of Middle Eastern Jews and politics in contemporary Israel. His analysis of the use to which the Tami party put Moroccan *Masoret* Judaism during the 1980s practically predicted the rise of its successor, the Shas party, later in the 1990s.

In my opinion, the impact of Shokeid's studies of Israelis in New York, brought to us in the third part of this book, is yet to be revealed. In these essays he conceptualized Israeliness as a 'national culture', to be carried across borders, and not necessarily bound to the political borders of the state. This novel kind of understanding was later followed by other ethnographies of 'Israelis across borders', such as Israeli travellers (C. Noy & E. Cohen, *Israeli backpackers and their society*, 2005). The above is probably no less true to say about the pieces that deal with the gay and lesbian Jewish community in New York, presented in the fourth part of the book.

In the end, the book *Three Jewish journeys* is one intellectual journey very worth taking ...

Yarden Enav *Ariel University*

Stang, Carla. *A walk to the river in Amazonia: ordinary reality for the Mehinaku Indians*. xviii, 221 pp., figs, illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2009. £37.50 (cloth)

Carla Stang's ethnography of the Mehinaku Indians of the Brazilian Amazon takes a decidedly phenomenological approach to understanding the ways in which indigenous Amazonian people experience 'everyday reality'. Based on fascinating accounts from her fieldwork, the author seeks to describe Mehinaku 'consciousness' by focusing not on specific practices or events that anthropologists conventionally assume to be important, but instead on the 'fragments' and 'flow' of personal experience one finds in between.

After a short introduction to the Mehinaku community and the uses of phenomenology within and outside anthropology, the book opens with a description of how Stang herself experienced a walk to the river with her Mehinaku friend Wanakuwalu. The premise of the book is that the ethnographic chapters that follow this account will allow readers to understand the walk she took, which is described again at the end of the book, this time from the perspective of Wanakuwalu. This final description of the walk to the river from a Mehinaku perspective is fiction insofar as it is

hypothetical, yet Stang attempts to make this interpretation familiar to readers through the ethnography that precedes it.

The chapters that intercede these two versions of the walk explore metaphysical questions about how Mehinaku people experience the 'substantiality' of things, such as the soul, animal spirits, mythical beings, and even ideas themselves. Among the 'things' that have concrete substance in this cosmology is the 'flow of desire' and the tensions this desire often brings in the rhythm of everyday social life as people and substances move between different 'worlds'. The book's detailed interpretation of indigenous cosmology is achieved through descriptions of Mehinaku practices and particularly myth, which, far from simply being esoteric tales about the origins of society, appears to permeate the intimate and public lives of the Mehinaku.

The book's main contribution is in combining two key strands of Amazonian anthropology, one focused on indigenous experiences of conviviality in everyday social life, and the other on how personhood and relations with various 'others' are conceived in Amazonian cosmologies. The book provides an excellent example of how these two strands of research should be understood to be not at odds, but instead part of the same process. The ways in which Stang describes how myths or stories constitute a cultural frame through which Mehinaku experience is understood and described is an excellent example of Viveiros de Castros's notion of 'sociocosmology': that is, in contrast to many Western formulations of society, in Amazonian perspective sociality and cosmology become one and the same. Nowhere is this clearer than in Stang's discussion of desire and the body, where she describes how changes in emotional consciousness can cause a person to enter into different bodily states and even non-human worlds. In this context, the body can be seen as 'a symptom or expression of the person's vision of the world' (p. 61). Strong emotional states thus have serious ramifications for individuals, who, for example, may become vulnerable to spiritual attack when they experience excessive desire. In response to Viveiros de Castro's formulation of perspectivism, which suggests that in Amazonian cosmology all souls and intentionalities share a human quality and are differentiated through the body, Stang reveals a 'spiritual diversity' in which the state of the spirit or soul affects the state of the body.

The book's integration of cosmology with everyday Mehinaku practice, along with its concise and evocative writing style, makes for an important contribution to Amazonian anthropology. The author's claim that a phenomenological approach allows the book to overcome the tendency to prioritize seemingly exotic practices in favour of the everyday appears somewhat overstated, especially given the number of UK anthropologists inspired by Joanna Overing's work on everyday life and 'the aesthetics of conviviality' in Amazonia (several of whom are discussed in the book). The introduction, which discusses the writings of various phenomenologists who have inspired the author, could have benefited from further discussion of approaches in Amazonian anthropology that have drawn on similar perspectives. However, Stang's book is one of the best examples of how Amazonian research today is beginning to bridge the previous gap between studies of seemingly abstract cosmology and fine-grained ethnography of everyday practice.

Although the framing of the book in stages between two contrasting accounts of the walk to the river is an innovative way of combining ethnography with openly reflexive conjecture, I also felt that Stang's interpretation of Wanakuwalu's walk failed at precisely what the book succeeded in accomplishing more generally: providing readers with the tools to understand Mehinaku cosmology not as exotic, but as integral to everyday life. While the walk does bring together many interesting aspects of the book, Stang's complex interpretative exploration of the short walk somehow makes Wanakuwalu less understandable than the people described in the preceding chapters.

Casey High *Goldsmiths, London*

War and violence

James, Wendy. *War and survival in Sudan's frontierlands: voices from the Blue Nile.* xxxvii, 339 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Oxford: Univ. Press, 2009. £75.00 (cloth), £25.00 (paper)

This important ethnography of war, violence, and the suffering of the Uduk community in the Ethiopian-Sudanese borderlands first appeared in hardcover in 2007, and this more affordable paperback is welcome in making this remarkable

story more widely known. A new preface to this edition sketches the conditions after 2007, notably the situation emerging after the 'Comprehensive Peace Agreement' (CPA) signed in January 2005 between North and South Sudan.

The focus of this book is on a small ethnic group (*c.*20,000), but the account is emblematic for the fate of small communities in the ongoing devastation owing to conflict, war, and abuse across Africa, from Angola to Somalia and from Sudan to Guinea. Repression, mass violence, civil war, genocidal campaigns, terrorist movements, and organized crime have brought untold misery and condemned hundreds of thousands of people to disease, death, and decline. Despite the so-called 'economic growth' figures and 'development' touted by global organizations and state authorities, African societies are in a dismal state, and peace and social stability precarious. Except for some places, there is no upward line in recovery or normalization of rural society in Africa. The Uduk are one example of a community that went through decades of suffering and destruction in the context of the Sudanese civil wars.

Wendy James's book is an impressive study, based on long-term field research in the turbulent area of Southeast Sudan bordering Ethiopia and in Khartoum, and gives great insights into the experiences of the Uduk (or 'Kwanim Pa) people and their wider (inter)national contexts. This is the third volume in a trilogy and takes the study of Uduk society, begun in relatively peaceful conditions and with a focus on social organization, culture, and religion, to a concern with the effects of encroaching violence and warfare that divided them (e.g, as they were drawn to fight for different armies) and virtually destroyed their society and cohesion as a people. The author locates the beginning of this upheaval in 1987, when the Uduk villages were destroyed in the civil war and the surviving people fled and dispersed. The first two books (of 1979 and 1988) were, as the author says, about a world now destroyed, before the violence set in. The subtitle of the present book already indicates the great importance that the author gives to the Uduk telling their stories in their own words and to covering the range of genres and ways in which they expressed their predicament. She not only presents rich interview material but also shows how Uduk used songs, dance, and music to make sense of their ordeal.

The book has a historical introduction about the Blue Nile borderlands, and then three parts devoted to war, flight, and survival. Part 1 is about the encroaching war and its bursting on the scene in the Blue Nile region, leading to the battles, killing, (forced) recruitment to warring parties (Uduk youth in the SPLA's Arrow Battalion), and dispersal. In part 2 the movements of flight, notably the back-and-forth treks to Ethiopia and the refugee life, stand central. Part 3 is about the return of the refugees and the reconstitution of 'home' and is also where we read about the poetry, dance, and music produced by Uduk in various situations, expressing their fears, feelings of loss, and hope.

This monograph makes absorbing reading; Wendy James has done a wonderful job. It is a moving story about humiliation, loss, and suffering, and a testimony to the resilience of a small group that did not go under but somehow survived. A brief review of this work cannot do justice to it, but let me just say that those who want to understand what the Sudanese civil war meant for local societies and how deep the wounds are that have been created by this useless conflict in Sudan are urged to read it.

The author noted that her present work has more the character of a history than of a conventional anthropological monograph. But from an anthropological point of view *War and survival* – apart from its contribution to the comparative ethnography of war and violence – gives new insights into the socio-cultural and psychological mechanisms that come in to play when durable violence uproots communities. It also shows the way in which anthropological fieldwork has fundamentally changed in recent decades: not only multi-sited and dynamic, but also facing insecure and unpredictable conditions necessitating different, adaptive approaches: for example, collaboration with relief projects and NGOs, and a capacity to deal with informants who are marked by anger, grief, and loss. (There is an accompanying website to the book on *http://voicesfromthebluenile.org*.)

Jon Abbink *African Studies Centre, Leiden*

Price, David H. *Anthropological intelligence: the deployment and neglect of American anthropology in the Second World War.* xxii, 370 pp., bibliogr. London, Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2008. £54.00 (cloth), £13.99 (paper)

In 1919 Franz Boas laid down a public challenge to anthropology. Bemused by the jingoism surrounding America's entry into the First World War, Boas had become increasingly distressed at

the way several colleagues had used their professional identities as archaeologists (and, worse, his letters of introduction) as covers for espionage in Central America. When the war ended, Boas declared that 'a person who uses science as a cover for political spying ... prostitutes his science in an unpardonable way and forfeits the right to be called a scientist' (quoted by Price, p. 12).

A similar clarity of political principle has motivated David Price's work over the past twenty years. Price has been a determined – if sometimes lonely – voice highlighting the risks of anthropological collaboration, both covert and overt, with military and intelligence agencies. He has used Freedom of Information legislation to access classified materials relating to anthropological contributions to military and intelligence operations during the Cold War. This led first to *Threatening anthropology* (2004), a book on the effects of McCarthyism on American anthropology. Realizing that many of the precedents for Cold War collaborations could be traced back to the Second World War, this second volume in a promised trilogy could be seen as the prequel. Price is partly motivated by frustration at what he sees as the silences surrounding military involvements, and how a lack of institutional and disciplinary memory has political consequences, most vividly seen in the increasingly open role played by anthropologists in combat operations in Iraq and Aghanistan.

Anthropological intelligence defines collaboration very broadly, and makes its case through layer after layer of closely detailed examples of different anthropological contributions to the war effort. Apart from an initial chapter on the First World War and Boas's intervention, and one on other Allied and Axis contributions to the Second World War, the majority of the book focuses on the US. One chapter unpacks the role of the professional associations, and another explores the new university-based research centres funded by philanthropies such as Rockefeller. Other chapters discuss the role and remit of a range of intelligence agencies that employed anthropologically trained staff or sought anthropological advice. Of these, one of the most important was the new Office of Strategic Services, founded in 1942 and later to become the CIA, and Price describes the secret missions and 'derring-do' of anthropologists such as Gregory Bateson and Carleton Coon in Asia and Africa.

One of the strengths of this compendious and diverse book is its careful retelling and rendition of archival sources. Price pays attention to both the serious and occasionally more bizarre consequences of collaboration. The book is sometimes dizzying in its detail, jumping from examples of anthropologists working as advisors to President Roosevelt to advice in an Ethnogeographic Board survival handbook on how to crawl like a seal if stranded in the Arctic and forced to hunt for food.

An important aspect of the book is its attention to the origins of the field of applied anthropology. Price details how the Society for Applied Anthropology was founded in 1941 by a group of anthropologists, led by Eliot Chapple and Conrad Arensberg, who wanted to take a more proactive approach to social change than seemed possible within the scholarly confines of the American Anthropological Association. The commitment of some within the new Society to engineered social change provoked important ethical debate, particularly in relation to the involvement of anthropologists in the running of Japanese internment camps in California. The leftist anthropologist Laura Thomson was a prominent dissenter, asking in 1944 whether practical social scientists were to become 'technicians for hire to the highest bidder' (p. 35). However, such expressions of disquiet did not prevent many from enthusiastically putting anthropology to use in managing and doing research on Japanese-American citizens turned into 'racial prisoners', and who could not give informed consent. At the time, few challenged the relocation and internment policies.

One can quibble at the relentlessness of Price's attention to detail, but that is part of the book's rhetorical strategy. It also works to counterbalance an implicit presentism driven by the author's avowed disquiet at the risks posed today by the increasing recruitment of anthropologists and anthropological knowledge by the intelligence services. One might question Price's presumption that everyone who trained as an anthropologist retains that identity in their subsequent professional lives and work, but his inclusive approach allows the reader to reflect on where and how they would draw their own ethical and political 'lines in the sand' in moments of crisis.

The book ends with a chapter entitled 'Postwar ambiguities', and a return to the discussion of the importance of clear ethical codes governing scientific practice when scholars work for the state. Price is clear that the war 'opened doors' between the academy and the intelligence community, and that the accompanying blurring of ethical principles

lasted long after the fight against fascism ended, leading to 'waves of Cold War funding for basic and applied research' (p. 281). As recent events have made painfully clear, these exchanges continue. Even if one does not agree with his relentless questioning of scholarly involvement with national policy during the fight against fascism, this is an area that needs close scrutiny and greater professional honesty. In documenting this difficult disciplinary past, Price has done an important service for both the history and future of anthropology.

David Mills, *University of Oxford*

Robben, Antonius C.G.M. (ed.). *Iraq at a distance: what anthropologists can teach us about the war*. ix, 186 pp., figs, bibliogrs. Philadelphia: Univ. Pennsylvania Press, 2010. £26.00 (cloth)

As an anthropologist who has conducted fieldwork in Iraq in recent years, I was eager to explore the methodological and theoretical dimensions of the assertion put forward by this edited volume – that the conditions in the post-9/11 world have necessitated the deployment of ethnographic imagination and anthropology at a distance, as areas such as Iraq 'are becoming inaccessible to fieldwork' (p. 3).

For those of us who believe that anthropology's vital contribution in these undeniably troubled times is precisely in its ability to engage with and provide thick description of the human and social effects of war and its aftermath, the arguments proposed here will prove challenging. Surprisingly, however (and somewhat disappointingly), a wider theoretical, methodological, and ethical discussion of the use of distanced ethnographic imagination is hardly touched upon in the collection. Sluka's chapter comes closest in a brief discussion on 'what role anthropologists should play in the war on terrorism' (p. 126). The exploration of anthropological ethics in the study of counterinsurgency, new codes of practice which have emerged, and the controversial Human Terrain System, is a much needed contribution to the discipline's twenty-first-century understandings of war, which could have been elaborated to great effect in the volume as a whole.

Robben is among the forefathers of ethnography of violent conflict, having brought us canonical collections on the cultures and psychosocial conditions which emerge from protracted conflict, and on the ethical, personal, and professional implications of fieldwork conducted 'under fire'. His chapter on mimetic military strategies provides an interesting ethnographic description of tactics in counterinsurgency (drawn comparatively from his extensive knowledge of and fieldwork in Argentina), but has little to say about their specific contours of and impacts on Iraq society.

In the collection as a whole, the special insights these experts could provide are lost amongst reiterations of statistics and material which a keen reader could as easily glean from journalistic or NGO reports. Anthropologists are hardly alone in observing that the Bush administration's rhetoric in the 'war on terror' and the lead-up to invasion of Afghanistan and Iraq employed Manichean tropes (Hinton); that violent conditions on the ground have severely curtailed the movement of regular Iraqis and affected their sense of place (Peteet); or that the 'battle for hearts and minds' was decisively lost as coalition forces consistently violated human rights and employed strategies of destabilization on the ground in Iraq (Sluka). That the US and British militaries had little in the way of coherent strategy, missed the lessons of history which previous conflicts might have provided, and knew little of the cultural contours of Iraqi society on the ground are points that have been made succinctly and effectively elsewhere. If we can scarcely disagree that it is 'at points of disjuncture between dominant narratives of war and the far more complex realities on the ground that anthropologists have something important to say' (p. 49), on reading the volume one feels deprived of precisely this analysis of complex realities.

For some who see the anthropological endeavour as giving voice to those not generally heard in the grand narratives of war, the volume is problematic. Al-Ali's chapter on women under occupation is an exception, providing much-needed data on the conditions faced by women in Iraq since 2003, in their own words. Her writing effectively plays with the idea of 'Iraq at a distance' in methodological terms as well, as her research relied upon the exilic narratives of Iraqi women living in Jordan and elsewhere.

The professional impulse towards what Sluka and Robben call a 'compassionate turn' (p. 4) in anthropology, and the indictment of the occupation of Iraq, are to be lauded. However, at times it feels as though the authors have lost sight of the delicate balance between providing impassioned anti-war stances on the invasion of Iraq, and anthropologically informed analysis

elucidating *why* such stances were adopted. Readers may be left wondering what, exactly '*anthropologists can teach us about the war*'. An account of how the authors view the theoretical, methodological, and ethical implications of conducting anthropology at a distance from violent war zones would have been a valuable and interesting approach for this book to advance. As Robben points out, there is great need for the particular, humanistic insights which anthropologists could provide – equipped as they are with the ethnographer's lens for understanding what for most is an Iraq in chaos. Although this volume compiles some impressive expertise on the anthropology of violent conflict, it is not the book to offer that approach.

Sarah Keeler *University of Exeter*

Stølen, Kristi Anne. *Guatemalans in the aftermath of violence: the refugees' return*. xvii, 236 pp., maps, bibliogr. Philadelphia: Univ. Pennsylvania Press, 2007. £39.00 (cloth)

The constitutive (or 'constructive') aspect of violence has been present in anthropology at least since Max Gluckman's classic works, but it regained prominence following conflicts in the last few decades. According to Kristi Anne Stølen, this book 'deals with three main topics: dynamics of violence, survival strategies in situations of extreme violence, and social reconstruction in the aftermath of violence' (p. ix). The issue of 'social reconstruction' is particularly interesting, as it opens up a whole new area of exploring how local and state mechanisms are coping with the return of the refugees.

The book is divided in two parts. Part I ('The dynamics of violence') provides a background for the general discussion, with the combination of historical sources and interviews that Stølen conducted in the village of La Quetzal in Guatemala. These interviews provide an amazing insight into the destinies of different people, and they include both victims of violence and their perpetrators. The author is successful in demonstrating that the guerrillas opposed to the government forces during the 1980s also committed crimes, although that is not something new for Mayanists with some acquaintance with the region's history.

Part II ('Reconstruction of livelihoods and identities') deals with the situation that the refugees encountered following their return, as well as different strategies that they employed in reconstructing their lives. A chapter on changing gender relations is particularly interesting, as it sums up in a relatively brief space the profound influence that the displacement and violence had on this aspect of people's lives. Despite the refugees' return and important changes in the political climate in the country (the book was finished around 2006 – there have been some important developments since then), the author is careful enough not to draw any great conclusions towards an inevitable happy ending, but notes that all the developments should provide 'hope for an enduring transformation toward peace and development in a country still characterized by injustice, violence and corruption' (p. 210).

The Guatemalan conflict began in 1954, following the CIA-led and inspired *coup d'état*, but reached its climax during the 1980s, in the period locally known in Spanish as *la violencia* ('the violence'), with at least 200,000 people killed (since 1978) and 500,000 refugees (50,000 in Mexico – from where most of Stølen's interviewees came back, 100,000 in the US and 250,000 internally displaced), out of the population of around eight million people. The peace accord was signed only in 1996. Given all of these numbers, one wonders to what extent the village where Stølen conducted her research, La Quetzal, in Petén, near the border of the Mexican state of Chiapas, could be seen as representative for the whole of the country. For example, the patterns of violence do seem slightly different in the Highland Maya areas, where the great majority of all the victims came from. It would also be interesting to compare attempts of people to return to these other areas.

Given the author's self-proclaimed intention to prove that government forces were not the only ones perpetrating crimes, it is interesting that she notes, agreeing with the findings of the Guatemalan Truth Commission, that 93 per cent of the assassinations were committed by the army, and 7 per cent by the guerrillas (p. 46). This does put the conclusion that 'all sides committed crimes' in a particular perspective. On the other hand, the 'terrorization of everyday life' mentioned (p. 57) should certainly sound familiar to anyone who did fieldwork in the late 1980s and early 1990s. One of the aspects that is not fully explained is how the author came to reside in the area – it seems that she was first part of an international organization (UNHCR?), and then joined with an NGO trying to help rebuild institutions of the village, but this should have been explained with greater clarity. This also leaves open the issue of communication –

for example, it seems that Stølen spoke only Spanish, in the area where many returnees were fluent only in their native Mayan languages (pp. 65ff.).

However, the book does provide clarity on the strategies of refugees trying to reassemble their lives. As anthropologists have been present in the conflict zones during the last century, they frequently struggled with issues related to violence. In her account of the return of the repatriated victims to a Guatemalan village, Stølen manages in accomplishing an almost impossible task of providing perspectives of the victims, perpetrators, as well as some observers – making this a valuable contribution to the anthropological literature on violence and conflict.

Aleksandar Bošković *Institute of Social Sciences, Belgrade*

Work and economic anthropology

Hann, Chris & Keith Hart (eds). *Market and society: the great transformation today*. xi, 320 pp., figs, bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2009. £60.00 (cloth)

The volume's fifteen chapters all engage critically and creatively with Polanyi's seminal *The great transformation* (1944), which was written 'at the end of a period of unparalleled disasters – two world wars, the Great Depression, Fascism, Stalinism and a lot of ugly conflicts like the Spanish Civil War' (p. 4). Polanyi is never out of sight, but this book is conducive to a growing interest in economic anthropology. The volume is the result of a workshop at the Max Planck Institute in 2006, which was well before the current financial crisis that has highlighted the relevance of Polanyi's intellectual heritage.

The book starts with an editorial introduction into Polanyi's biography that places his work in the wider academic landscape and ends with Robotham's critical exploration of the individual chapters and its implementations for Polanyi's intellectual heritage and economic anthropology at large. The rest of the volume is divided into three parts. The first part explores the implications of *The great transformation* for a wide range of theories on economic life with contributions on the dialectics of mutuality and market, developments in new economic sociology, a Durkheimian analysis of markets, and French institutional economics. These chapters offer an introduction into Polanyi's theoretical apparatus and contextualize it in a wide variety of disciplinary and national debates.

The second part examines the historical implications of Polanyi's work. Hart urges us to rethink Polanyi's periodization of the nineteenth century in order to gain insight into the current financial crisis. Graeber calls attention to state violence and war in relation to economic transformations. The two other chapters carefully scrutinize Polanyi's 'toolbox' when they review his inconsistent approach to householding and his meagre attention to labour.

The chapters of the volume's third part consist of ethnographically informed contributions on enduring socio-political and economic problems. Two chapters examine the 'fictive commodity' of labour circumstances in the steel plant unions of India and environmental protection in Jamaica. The other chapters concentrate on ideology and morality of the oil and financial markets, voluntary organization in the UK's third sector, and socialism in Maoist and contemporary China.

The volume presents a rich introduction into Polanyi's work and reveals the – admittedly somewhat murky – contours of contemporary economic anthropology, and to some extent also economic sociology. The authors put Polanyi's intellectual heritage at the heart of their analysis and engage with his insights into 'fictitious commodities' of land, labour, and money, and the interplay of forms of market exchange, redistribution, reciprocity, and householding.

Beckert aptly refers to 'the comedy of errors behind the concept of embeddedness' (p. 43). The contributions show that economic anthropology has moved far beyond its long held adagio that money erodes social relations and institutions, and that therefore 'money is baaaaad' (B. Maurer, 'The anthropology of money', *Annual Review of Anthropology* **35**, 2006, 19). At the same time, however, many contributions give the impression that money is also bad when it is embedded in social relations and institutions. Among others, Robotham points this out in his concluding remarks and the point is well made in Hann's fascinating contribution on the disasters that are caused by socialism in China. The volume's contributions highlight how important it is to examine money and the economy at large within specific social configurations.

The chapters could have been organized in many different ways. However, by providing this particular structure the editors advocate the amalgamation of theoretical reflection, historical analysis, and ethnographic research. The volume shows the insights that this line of inquiry has to offer into a wide variety of economic constellations and human conditions. The contributions also show that it is a daunting task. Authors point to some of the ambiguities in Polanyi's theoretical approach, question some of his historical interpretations, and raise questions about the ability to scrutinize Polanyi's work through ethnographic research methods. Some of the authors explore these problems in detail while others show how Polanyi's insights can be applied without too much inhibition for the study of phenomena that bear little resemblance to nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Europe.

The consequence of this focus on *The great transformation* is that Polanyi's main concern – the causes of human suffering – sometimes becomes secondary to the exploration of his intellectual heritage. My main criticism, however, is the book's stiff price, which makes it tricky to subscribe it to more advanced students of economic anthropology who would gain so much from it. At the same time, such a subscription will surely provoke interesting debates on price, debt, and many other economic issues that this book explores so powerfully.

Erik Baehre *Leiden University*

Meerwarth, Tracy L., Julia C. Gluesing & Brigitte Jordan (eds). *Mobile work, mobile lives: cultural accounts of lived experiences*. 158 pp., figs, illus., bibliogrs. Oxford, Malden, Mass.: Wiley-Blackwell, 2008. £12.00 (paper)

This book was reviewed, in circumstances fitting to its subject matter, over a three-day period while the reviewer was stranded at George Bush International Airport in Houston, Texas, because ash from an Icelandic volcano had closed European airspace. US airports feature prominently in this volume, a collection of essays in which eight professional ethnographers reflect on the mobile lives of knowledge workers. Indeed the airport is such a central metonym for the themes the authors address that the front cover photograph shows one of the editors sitting in an airport lounge, in transit, with a pile of papers on her lap, a laptop on the table in front of her, and a roll-on suitcase standing to one side. Airport lounges – Meerwarth writes – epitomize those 'transitional, away, spaces' that mobile workers 'occupy en-route to a destination' (p. 111). After three days spent wandering around an airport with a file of academic papers and a laptop, however, my problem with these reflections is that they do not critically reflect on the social and material conditions of our mobility, with regards to both labour and technology.

If this collection has something to offer it is that it provides an insight into the experiences and theoretical preoccupations of people who have made a living as anthropologists in business and industry. Over the course of their careers the three editors have been variously employed as in-house ethnographers or research consultants for a range of major transnational corporations, including General Motors, Ford, Nissan, Sun Microsystems, and Xerox. In these contexts, they write, ethnography has been a tool used to 'solve organizational, communicational and design problems'. In this volume they turn the tools of their trade upon themselves, creating what they call 'a series of auto-ethnographic, first person accounts' that aim to describe how career choices are combined with life choices, and how boundaries between work and life are managed (p. 3). Their intention is to fill a gap in current debates about new kinds of 'remote', 'virtual', or 'dispersed' work in which work is understood as 'more mobile, unbounded and independent of particular localities' (p. 2). The papers tell stories of consultants who have attempted to build relations of collegiality and hierarchy from a distance (Michael Youngblood), homes that allow them to work elsewhere (Brigitte Jordan, Perri Strawn), and work lives apart from peers and home lives (Loril Gossett). Reflections on these different problems give rise to different analytical terms: 'intertasking' (Patricia Lange), 'located mobility' (Amy Goldmacher), and 'nomadism' (Tracy Meerwarth)

What the authors mean by 'mobile work' and 'mobility', however, appears to be a distinctly located phenomenon. The kinds of challenges described here are rooted in the upward social mobility of highly educated graduates, in the working arrangement of transnational corporations, and orbit around major European and American cities. So much of the travel they describe is airborne that it even ceases to be described as such and mobility simple becomes synonymous with flight. And what they mean when they speak of mobility

seems invariably to mean the movement of people mediated by things, and less the movement of things or ideas mediated by people.

Most surprising, perhaps, is the volume's failure to acknowledge the structural conditions under which mobile work and mobile lives become necessary rather than simply possible. The authors choose terms like nomadism that celebrate the emancipatory and entrepreneurial character of mobile work, but avoid other analytical concepts like 'flexibility' and 'precarity' that place the experience of mobility within wider historical transformations in capitalist economies. While the editors and contributing authors frequently refer to 'capital', nowhere do we encounter work as labour.

As a result the structural conditions that enable mobile work and mobile lives are invisible and silent. This complaint began to seem more and more evident during my enforced sojourn in Houston's George Bush International. Airports employ vast battalions of people to police, manage, control, and clean, monitoring and enabling the movement of hundreds of thousands of passengers. This physical labour intersects with the vast array of machines, technological devices, and systems upon which our mobility is firmly dependent. The focus and interests of the contributors to this volume, however, mean that they fail to engage with their own conditions of mobility, on the particularities of work in particular spaces, and on the specific relationships and technological forms beyond laptops, telephones, and the internet on which the mobility of white-collar professionals through them depends.

Jamie Cross *Goldsmiths, London*

Rowe, Ann Pollard, Laura M. Miller & Lynn A. Meisch. *Weaving and dyeing in highland Ecuador*. xxiii, 327 pp., maps, figs, plates, illus., bibliogr. Austin: Univ. Texas Press, 2007. £25.00 (cloth)

This volume on weaving and dyeing in the Ecuadorian highlands offers a fascinating level of detail. It presents material produced by researchers at the Textile Museum in Washington, DC, predominantly in the 1970s and 1980s, and serves as a source of information on the North Andean textiles in the collection. As a non-weaver and social anthropologist with a long field experience in a weaving community in the Ecuadorian Andes, I found this text to be an unusual and at times challenging read. Whereas I have studied weaving in relation to an indigenous economy, the contributors to this volume place weaving and dyeing within a descriptive universe of technical and technological indigenous traditions. Procedures are so carefully and meticulously described that they might serve as instructions for a skilful practitioner who, as Ann Rowe mentions in the preface, would like to 'reproduce the process'. Detailed descriptions are followed by an impressive number of photos and pedagogical illustrations that actually bring us quite near to an everyday crafting reality and to the knowledge that is implied and embodied in the production of indigenous textiles. It should be mentioned that descriptions are, to a large extent, disconnected from other aspects of the social fabric of work – in indigenous homes, workshops, and communities and on local and regional markets and related to trade. I appreciate the case studies that contextualize the work of the weavers: here persons are active within social environments and are connected to economic practices and exchange rationales. Too quickly and too often, however, the cases enter into descriptions of sequential procedures in the human use of tools and techniques.

The authors' main concern is to document the uses of the back-strap loom of pre-Hispanic origin. In the chapters on weaving on the treadle loom, introduced to the Andes from Europe, and on dyeing, descriptions are less technical and lay out more of the historical and social context. This is especially marked in relation to the chapter on dyeing techniques, which in the North Andean context were closely linked to the production in the colonial textile factories – *obrajes*. Interestingly, the distinction made between the indigenous and pre-Hispanic, on the one side, and techniques and technologies of external origins, on the other, are also reflected in the form of presentation. Contextualization is predominantly done in relation to weaving on the treadle loom and to dyeing, while weaving on the back-strap loom is reserved to the detail of technical elaboration. While this difference reflects the varying quality of the material the researchers have gathered on the different loom technologies and production techniques, it also reflects a theoretical/methodological approach. Main distinctions of this kind are based on the authors' delimitation of the indigenous and traditional to the type of production which served and serves people's internal needs and preferences. This is most clearly evidenced in the indigenous communities

which are most heavily integrated into external markets and which base their textile production largely on tourist costumers – the Otavalos of the Imbabura province. The authors argue that Otavaleños distinguish clearly between the products they elaborate for the external and tourist market and the products meant for their internal use.

The concern of the authors is to document the traces and signs of long traditions in current practices, and in this way to capture the original or even autochthonous. This is a complicated project since indigenous highland weaving has been in a constant process of change through the incorporation of new influences. References in the volume to 'technological mixture' and inter-ethnic relationships, and also to hybrid techniques and to creativity and innovation, indicate practices and traditions of adaptation to change among indigenous highland communities and peoples. In my view this volume should be read as a contribution to the regional literature, with the identification of similar techniques and technologies used to explore the boundaries of the Ecuadorian highlands as a particular cultural area, on the fringes of the Inca Empire, and with a specific colonial history related to textile production and the textile economy. Nevertheless, the material presented could potentially address a range of other relevant issues, and could also have benefited from being linked to contemporary academic discussions concerning the meaning and continuous constitution of the indigenous in the historical and contemporary Andean highlands.

Esben Leifsen *The Norwegian University of Life Sciences*